



Review Research Trends in Groundwater and Stable Isotopes

Paúl Carrión-Mero ^{1,2,*}, Néstor Montalván-Burbano ^{1,3}, Gricelda Herrera-Franco ^{4,5}, Luis Domínguez-Granda ^{6,7}, Lady Bravo-Montero ^{1,6,7,*} and Fernando Morante-Carballo ^{1,5,6}

- ¹ Centro de Investigación y Proyectos Aplicados a las Ciencias de la Tierra (CIPAT), ESPOL Polytechnic University, Guayaquil P.O. Box 09-01-5863, Ecuador
- ² Facultad de Ingeniería en Ciencias de la Tierra (FICT), ESPOL Polytechnic University, Guayaquil P.O. Box 09-01-5863, Ecuador
- ³ Department of Economy and Business, University of Almería, Ctra. Sacramento s/n, La Cañada de San Urbano, 04120 Almería, Spain
- ⁴ Faculty of Engineering Sciences, Universidad de la Península de Santa Elena (UPSE), La Libertad P.O. Box 240204, Ecuador
- ⁵ Geo-Recursos y Aplicaciones (GIGA), Campus Gustavo Galindo, ESPOL Polytechnic University, Km. 30.5 11 Vía Perimetral, Guayaquil P.O. Box 09-01-5863, Ecuador
- ⁶ Facultad de Ciencias Naturales y Matemáticas (FCNM), Campus Gustavo Galindo, ESPOL Polytechnic University, Guayaquil P.O. Box 09-01-5863, Ecuador
- ⁷ Centro de Agua y Desarrollo Sustentable (CADS), ESPOL Polytechnic University, Guayaquil P.O. Box 09-01-5863, Ecuador
- Correspondence: pcarrion@espol.edu.ec (P.C.-M.); lkbravo@espol.edu.ec (L.B.-M.); Tel.: +593-998-265-290 (P.C.-M.); +593-959-141-436 (L.B.-M.)

Abstract: Groundwater is essential in the management of water resources globally. The water quality of aquifers is affected by climate change and population growth, aspects that can be addressed with stable isotope analysis. This study aims to carry out an analysis of the scientific information related to groundwater and stable isotopes (GSI) using scientific databases (Scopus and Web of Science) to evaluate the intellectual structure of the subject and the emerging research lines. The methodology includes: (i) topic search selection, (ii) tools in databases processing, (iii) bibliometric analysis, and (iv) review by clustering technique. The results showed that the scientific production of GSI can be addressed through three evolution periods: I (1969–1990), II (1991–2005), and III (2006–2021). Periods I and II did not significantly contribute to publications because, in the past, most of the student's thesis (M.Sc. and Ph.D) consisted of writing a report that summarizes their works. Therefore, the researcher was not obliged to publish their results in a professional journal. Finally, the third period showed exponential growth, representing 82.34% of the total publications in this theme because, in the last years, institutions require at least one scientific article depending on the country and university, in order to graduate with an M.Sc. and PhD. Finally, the contribution of this study is reflected in the recognition of new research lines and their applicability by the knowledge of recharge sources, environmental aspects, infiltration, knowledge of the aquifer-meteoric water system, and groundwater-superficial water interaction. These aspects offer the possibility of analyzing integrated water resources management at the watershed or river-aquifer systems level.

Keywords: coastal aquifer; environmental isotopes; intellectual structure; co-citation analysis

1. Introduction

Groundwater is one of the most important resources in the freshwater supply to meet the needs of a region [1,2]. Globally, 2.5 billion people depend on groundwater supplies for their basic needs [3–5]. Groundwater and surface water constitute a complex cycle in the atmosphere, the earth's surface and the soil [6,7]. A challenge in the sustainable management of groundwater resources is the lack of comprehensive studies that involve the quantification of groundwater depletion and aquifer deterioration [8]. Identifying



Citation: Carrión-Mero, P.; Montalván-Burbano, N.; Herrera-Franco, G.; Domínguez-Granda, L.; Bravo-Montero, L.; Morante-Carballo, F. Research Trends in Groundwater and Stable Isotopes. *Water* **2022**, *14*, 3173. https://doi.org/10.3390/ w14193173

Academic Editors: Shengjie Wang, Buli Cui, Bin Yang and Huawu Wu

Received: 20 August 2022 Accepted: 29 September 2022 Published: 9 October 2022

Publisher's Note: MDPI stays neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.



Copyright: © 2022 by the authors. Licensee MDPI, Basel, Switzerland. This article is an open access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC BY) license (https:// creativecommons.org/licenses/by/ 4.0/). aquifer quality and vulnerability characteristics helps decision-makers manage groundwater resources and mitigate potential contamination pathways [9,10] where these ecological techniques of green filters exist [11–13].

The most crucial water problem facing the world is water scarcity, intensifying during the 21st century due to population and economic growth and the need to protect environmental assets [14–16]. The characterization of groundwater flow systems requires the identification of the dominant spatial and temporal patterns of their movement and flow scales [17–19].

The main processes that influence groundwater chemistry are salinization, precipitation, mineral dissolution, cation exchange and human activity [20]. Therefore, stable isotope data in water (δ^{18} O and δ^{2} H) serve as markers to identify the different flow paths and origins of water [21]. Interactions between groundwater and surface water are complex because they are related to climate, landform, geology, and biotic factors [22,23]. Therefore, hydrogeochemical data and stable environmental isotopes are used to identify recharge sources and water-rock interactions in the direction of groundwater flow [24,25].

The relevance of the stable isotope technique resides in that the most commonly studied elements (H, C, O, and S) constitute the major components of Earth's reservoirs (water, air, lithosphere, and organic matter) [26,27]. For example, hydrogen and oxygen isotopic studies of natural waters have a distinct advantage over studies using other chemical indicators due to hydrogen and oxygen being the principal constituents of aqueous solutions [28].

As a consequence, applying stable isotopes in groundwater has multiple benefits. For example, a study in Japan used stable water isotopes (δ^{18} O and δ^{2} H) and hydrochemical information to estimate groundwater recharge in a mountain-plain transition area [29]. In the Maheshwaram watershed in India, these isotopes were used to understand the dynamics of groundwater sources and flow paths in the watershed [30]. Complementarily, in the case of the Qaidam basin in China, the implementation of representative cations and anions (K⁺, Na⁺, Ca²⁺, Mg²⁺, Cl⁻, SO₄²⁻, HCO₃⁻) and isotopes (²H, ¹⁸O, ³H, ¹³C and ¹⁴C) improved the understanding of the origin, flow pattern, hydrochemical evolution, and control mechanisms of regional groundwater systems [31]. Finally, relationships between δ^{2} H and δ^{18} O values in precipitation and elevation represent helpful tools for evaluating groundwater recharge areas and flow paths [32].

Given that the importance of isotopic analyses in groundwater would complement a bibliometric study on this subject, groundwater and stable isotopes (GSI). Bibliometrics provides a clear and precise answer to a global analysis of a given country, journal or field of study [33–35]. In addition, these bibliometric studies allow for the exploring of the structure of scientific publications, collaboration patterns and outstanding areas of knowledge [36,37]. Various research fields have applied bibliometrics in the evaluation and prediction of scientific productivity, development and future trends [38–42].

This theme is of global interest for watershed management authorities and its inhabitants, whose main economic activities often depend on groundwater reserves. For this reason, some research questions have arisen about the relationship between stable isotopes and groundwater: what is the contribution of the theme (GSI) in scientific research, emerging methods and trends?; and, complementary to this, what are the most representative components of the intellectual structure and relationships of GSI (authors, documents, topics, countries and journals) and the topics associated with this structure?

Answering these research questions was purposed as an objective to carry out an analysis of the scientific information related to GSI using scientific databases (Scopus and WoS) to evaluate the intellectual structure of the subject and the emerging lines of research.

This work consists of five sections. The first contains an introduction to the applicability of stable isotope techniques in groundwater evaluation. Section 2 presents the methodology for the treatment and use of the data described in four phases (search and document selection, database treatment, bibliometric maps, and research trend analysis). Section 3 presents the intellectual structure of stable isotopes, groundwater and the analysis of publications related to the subject, according to their quantity and quality. Section 4 presents the discussion of the exposed analyses. Finally, Section 5 presents the main conclusions, findings and limitations of this study.

2. Materials and Methods

The methodology includes four research phases: (i) topic search selection, (ii) tools in databases processing, (iii) bibliometric analysis, and (iv) review by clustering technique (see Figure 1).



Figure 1. Methodological scheme applied to GSI.

2.1. Topic Search Selection

Bibliometric studies require the selection of a reliable database with quality information [35,43]. The databases of the Web of Science (WoS, launched by Clarivate Analytics, London, UK) and Scopus (developed by Elsevier, Amsterdam, The Netherlands) are the most widely used in bibliometrics [44]. The results (articles) and impacts (citations) of the countries obtained from these two databases are strongly correlated [45,46]. Therefore, both databases (WoS and Scopus) were used due to institutional access and significant journal coverage (20,346 journals in Scopus and 13,605 in WoS) [47].

Data collection was carried out in January 2022 using a series of descriptors related to the term groundwater, contained in the title, abstract and keywords, together with Boolean logic functions (AND, OR), which allowed the search to be carried out (see Table 1). A total of 9613 documents were obtained as a result of the initial search. The search terms selected were the following: groundwater and stable* isotope*.

Table 1. Topic Search of GSI	Table 1	Topic	Search	of GSI
------------------------------	---------	-------	--------	--------

Database	Initial Number of Documents	Topic Search
Scopus	4759	(TITLE-ABS-KEY ("groundwater") AND TITLE-ABS-KEY ("stable* isotope*")) AND (EXCLUDE (PUBYEAR, 2022))
WoS	4804	Topic: ("groundwater") AND Topic: ("stable* isotope*"). Period Time: 1900–2021. Indexes: SCI-EXPANDED, SSCI, A&HCI, CPCI-S, CPCI-SSH, BKCI-S, BKCI-SSH, ESCI, CCR-EXPANDED, IC.

Prior to downloading the database, some inclusion and exclusion criteria were designated in selecting the documents obtained [48]. Considering all types of documents, languages, and subject areas was added as an inclusion criterion because it is a topic of great importance at the international level, pretending to know its trends and advances over time [49], excluding 2022 for the current year.

2.2. Tools in Database Treatment

The results obtained from the Scopus search were downloaded in BibTeX format and those of WoS in plaintext format for later treatment in RStudio. Both formats include bibliographic information, citations, abstracts, keywords, and references. However, Scopus and WoS differ in their download formats, scope terms, data volume, and coverage policies [50]. Therefore, the Bibliometrix library was used to unify these databases [51]. This library belongs to the statistical software RStudio, which is freely available [52,53]. The unification of Scopus and WoS allows for the deleting of duplicate documents and incomplete and erroneous items of the resulting 6633 documents. Five types of software were used in the analysis of the extracted data:

- Microsoft Excel: this software allows the analysis of scientific production through documents, languages, subject areas and journals [54–56].
- RStudio: this is an integrated development environment, launched in 2011 by Joseph J. Allaire, that belongs to R (free software) [52,53]. R version 4.0.5 was used for the big data processing and merging databases (Scopus and WoS). R was developed by Ross Ihaka y Robert Gentleman in Auckland, New Zealand. RStudio enabled automatic post-cleanup, preserving WoS files and removing duplicate Scopus documents [57].
- Bibliometrix: This is an RStudio package developed by Massimo Aria and Corrado Cuccurullo in University of Naples Federico I (Naples, Italy) [51]. This software processes the information by encoding it in RStudio [58] by using two functions: readfile and conver2df, to (i) load and convert data to UTF-8, and (ii) extract and create a data frame, respectively.
- VOSviewer: This is free software developed by the University of Leiden (Leiden, Netherlands), which allows the analysis of the intellectual structure of a knowledge field through the bibliometric maps construction [59,60]. This program has been widely used in different areas of knowledge [61–65].
- ArcGIS Pro: This is a Geographic Information Systems (GIS) software developed by Environmental Systems Research Institute (ESRI), in Redlands, California [66]. This software represents countries' contributions according to the number of publications worldwide and has been used in several bibliometric studies [35,42].

2.3. Bibliometric Analysis

Two main techniques are used in bibliometric analyses: performance analysis and science mapping [67,68]. Performance analysis encompasses the study of the structure of scientific publications, such as publication year, number of documents, citations, journals, countries, authors, and affiliations [69]. Otherwise, science mapping allows the graphical representation of research fields and subfields, observing their links [70]. In addition, these maps expose the relationships between some variables, such as co-occurrence with the author's keywords.

Bibliometrix software was used to generate some complementary bibliometric analyses, relating two or three variables of the intellectual and conceptual structure of the field of study. These analyses included Sankey Plot maps (Three-Fields Plot) which relate three variables: countries, authors, and keywords [71]. They also included the Thematic Evolution graph, which analyzes the evolution in periods of the subject of study [38].

2.4. Review by Clustering Technique

A literature review permits one to know the intellectual state of a topic [72,73]. It also collects data based on eligibility criteria, reduces biases and errors, and identifies possible gaps in research efforts [74,75]. The systematic analysis structure is based on keywords, literature, and the analysis of the results [76]. A literature review uses an algorithm that allows for the evaluating of the literature selection in a determinated field of study [77].

For the literature review in this work, we selected a sample of 20 documents per cluster, considering the most significant clusters of the 11 clusters obtained (clusters one to six) of the author keywords bibliometric map, according with the occurrence in the databases [78].

As a result, were reviewed a total of 120 publications. Furthermore, it was considered the most cited and relevant publications in the selected clusters, generating a table with the main topics related to the clusters selected and a description of the research trend lines in each cluster analyzed.

3. Results

3.1. Evolution of Scientific Production

The scientific production in the GSI line of research shows a growth in the interest in the topic of the academy (see Figure 2), presenting 5455 documents between the years 2006–2021, which represents 82.24% of the publications. The analysis of the results was divided into three periods: (i) constant (1969–1990), (ii) linear (1991–2005), and (iii) exponential (2006–2021). According to the mathematical form of growth, the periods of scientific production were selected.



Figure 2. Scientific production of GSI.

Scientific production was evaluated using Price's law [79], which measures the increase in research in the field of study, showing exponential growth [80,81]. The entire production of the study field was estimated, and a growth model was generated (see Figure 2). The equation obtained ($y = 20^{-105} e^{0.1225x}$) has a value of $R^2 = 0.9857$, which verifies that the GSI is growing exponentially, demonstrating its interest in the academic world to be recognised as a field of study.

In determining the topics related to GSI in different subperiods, it was necessary to apply a matrix of co-words and grouping methods, thus exploring the evolution over time of this field of study [38]. For this analysis, a strategic diagram to show the themes with different Callon's centrality (x-axis) and density (y-axis) [38] was applied, as is shown in Figure 3a–c. Callon's centrality is an indicator of theme's importance across a full set of publications, while Callon's density is an indicator of the theme's development [82,83].



Figure 3. Thematic evolution of GSI in three periods. (**a**–**c**) Thematic maps (strategic diagrams). The circle size is proportional to the total frequency of terms in each theme. Each theme is labeled with the corresponding three most frequent keywords, and (**d**) Evolution map (Sankey graph), where the thickness of the edges is proportional to the inclusion index.

These graphs (Figure 3a–c) consist of four quadrants, whose location determines how developed or new the topic is, as described below:

Quadrant I (upper right): topics with high density and centrality are called motor themes, with strong links to other topics in other quadrants.

Quadrant II (upper left): themes of high density and low centrality, called developed and isolated themes.

Quadrant III (lower left): themes with low density and centrality, called emerging or declining themes.

Quadrant IV (lower right): themes of low density and high centrality, called basic and transversal themes, focusing on general questions that were transversal to the different research areas of a domain.

Period I (1969–1990): The growth in publications on GSI was reduced during these 21 years of scientific production, with only 167 publications, which represented 2.52% of the total publications on this subject. Deuterium has been identified as a motor theme as its discovery dates back to 1934 [84]. Stable isotopes became an emerging topic because these techniques are considered essential in groundwater systems' qualitative and quantitative evaluation [85–88]. The first publication related to the GSI was published in 1969, which produced 68 citations, where the isotopic composition of mineral water sources in the Jordan Rift Valley was analyzed [89]. The most cited publication (581) is that of Allan J.R. and Matthews R.K. [90], where variations in the carbon and oxygen isotopic composition of limestones generated during early freshwater diagenesis was analyzed. The second

most cited publication is that of the authors Maoszewski P. and Zuber A [91]. Three new lumped parameter models were developed to interpret environmental radioisotope data in groundwater systems, resulting in 546 citations. Until 1990, the publications in the field of study focused on topics such as: (i) the isotopic composition of waters [92,93], (ii) carbonate diagenesis [94,95], and (iii) the use of stable isotope methods for groundwater studies [86–89]. These studies are considered the basis for applying stable isotope techniques for future research.

Period II (1991–2005): In this period there was notable growth in the number of publications on GSI. With this, their interest in the subject, with 1011 documents, represents 15.25% of the scientific production. After 21 years, stable isotopes went from being a driving theme to a transversal theme. Isotopes and hydrology appear as emerging topics. On the other hand, deuterium went from being an emerging theme to a theme in transition to becoming an engine theme. Similarly, the topics under development, aligned with the emerging topics, are hydrochemistry and salinity. Finally, recharge and groundwater have been established as motor themes, with a strong relationship with the themes of the other quadrants. The publication by the author Dawson [96] stands out, where the use of soil water and groundwater by trees and forests was investigated through measurements of transpiration rates using porometry, sap flow methods and the Bowen ratio method. In this period, publications on the following topics stand out: (i) arid region recharge [97–99], (ii) groundwater age through isotopes [100–102], (iii) denitrification [103–105], (iv) groundwater flow with stable water isotopes (δ^{18} O and δ^{2} H) [106–108], and (v) water movements through isotope analysis [109–112].

In the past (the first and second periods), most of the M.Sc. and Ph.D theses consisted of writing a report summarizing the work and its results. Therefore, the researcher was not obliged to publish the results of his career in a professional journal, decreasing the number of publications.

Period III (2006–2021): There is evidence of exponential growth in publications on GSI, with 5455 documents representing 82.24% of scientific production. In the last 15 years, the use of environmental tracers has become an emerging topic in studies related mainly to: (i) the solution of hydrological problems with environmental isotopes [113–116], (ii) groundwater salinization [117–119], (iii) the hydrochemical-isotopic characterisation of groundwater [120–122], and (iv) coastal aquifers recharge [123–125]. The topics under development are studies related to nitrates and oxygen isotopes. Also, the representative driving theme of this period is precipitation, which has evolved from previous themes such as recharge and groundwater. Finally, isotopes appear as cross-cutting themes that are not closely related to the rest of the emerging themes. However, the stable isotopes are specifically found in the transition zone from quadrant IV to I, which indicates that it could become the driving theme with the longest evolution time in the coming years (1969–2021).

This exponential increase in the number of articles is related to changes in university requirements for receiving M.Sc. and Ph.D degrees. In many universities, the research and its results are published in several professional articles, increasing the number of publications in this period. Another reason for this increase is the improvement in the sampling methods and measuring equipment that made it more accurate and easier to operate. Currently, the amounts of water required to perform chemical and isotopic analyses are very small. In parallel, software and data processing made it possible to increase the resolution of the statistical trend, with more variety of trends and more professional material that can be published. The most cited publication in this period was Mulholland et al.'s study [126], with 863 citations. These authors used stable nitrogen isotope tracers in 72 streams and eight regions, representing various biomes. It showed that total nitrate uptake is related to the ecosystem's photosynthesis. Finally, denitrification is linked with ecosystem respiration. The second most cited publication (699) was by Burgin and Hamilton [127], where the importance of alternative nitrate removal pathways was analyzed in aquatic ecosystems, including the application of stable isotopes and other tracer techniques.

3.2. Countries Contribution

Considering the authors' affiliation with the articles, the countries' contribution to this topic was included [128]. Furthermore, a bibliographic coupling analysis of countries was carried out to measure the references of publications in the database, particularly the countries involved [129]. VOSviewer was used for this analysis, and a threshold of at least five documents per country was set, with 78 countries reaching this threshold (see Figure 4). The colours distinguish them according to the number of publications on GSI, whereas the countries in white are those without publications on GSI. Finally, it was demonstrated that most of the publications were made in developed countries due to the rise and international importance of this topic.



Figure 4. Countries contribution to GSI.

Additionally, an analysis of the scientific production by country was carried out, which presents a rule of association between three variables that determine the relationship of an investigation [51]. This analysis showed the author-country-keyword intersection with a limit of 10 variables per category (see Figure 5).



Figure 5. Author-Country-Keyword relation.

This study revealed the most relevant countries that contribute to scientific production (e.g., the USA, China and Germany), which coincides with the most cited authors and affiliations. For example, Zhang Y. (USA), Li J. (China), and Richnow H. (Germany) are authors who have published studies on topics related to the composition of stable isotopes in surface-groundwater and evidence of stable isotopes in groundwater salinization and its impact. Another reason for the large number of articles coming from these countries is that there are still many areas that have not yet been studied in detail, and thanks to the combination between many universities and students for the M.Sc. and PhD degrees, it can be documented as a new scientific production in GSI.

The following countries stand out among the 78 countries that have conducted scientific research on the GSI: China, the United States, Japan, Australia, and Germany, as shown in Table 2.

R	Country	Publications	Cites	CCL	Main Topics	References
					Groundwater recharge	[130,131]
1	China	1180	15,784	73	Surface-groundwater interaction	[132,133]
					Hydrochemical evaluation	[134–136]
	TT. t. 1				Isotope hydrology	[137–139]
2	United	1553	45,656	74	Stable isotopes in groundwater	[114,140,141]
	States				Groundwater recharge and flow	[1/2 1/3]
					characterization	[142,140]
					Groundwater nitrate contamination	[144–147]
3	Japan	312	4590	70	Groundwater characterization	[108,148–150]
					Residence times and flow paths	[151–153]
					Stable isotopes in groundwater	[154–156]
4	Australia	424	10,804	68	Groundwater quality	[156-159]
					Environmental isotopes in	[160]
					groundwater systems	
					Hydrogeochemical characterization	[161,162]
5	Germany	788	17,521	74	Stable isotope in water resources	[163,164]
					Hydrological processes	[165,166]

Table 2. Main Countries Collaboration about GSI.

Note: R: Ranking; CCL: Collaboration Countries Links.

3.3. Most Relevant Sources

This analysis generates a global vision of the disciplines that make up the intellectual structure of the subject under study [35]. A total of 1085 sources formed this field of study. Table 3 shows the top 10 journals with the highest number of publications, where the *Journal of Hydrology* has the highest number of contributions (494). In this journal, the most cited article (565) is by McGuire and McDonnell. The authors conducted a review study on lumped parameter transit time modelling for the watershed of water drainage to promote new advances in watershed hydrology [167]. The second and third positions correspond to the *Hydrogeology Journal* and *Applied Geochemistry* journals.

3.4. Review by Clustering Analysis

The keyword co-occurrence network analysis provides a network in which the terms that appear most frequently in the field of study are presented [35], related to GSI. The network helps explore themes (keywords), thematic groups (clusters), and existing research gaps [168,169].

Graphical and multidimensional representation of the author's keywords co-occurrence map was performed with VOSviewer [83,170]. A total of 9580 keywords were obtained, of which 340 have a co-occurrence of at least five incidents. For example, in Figure 6, 11 clusters, 340 nodes (keywords), 5356 links and a total link strength of 15,807 are shown. The midterm is a stable isotope (cluster 4 in yellow) with 2056 occurrences and a relationship with 310 terms (topics).

R	Journal	Country	SJR	ND	Main Publication Topics
1	Journal of Hydrology	Netherlands	1.68	494	Hydrological sciences, including water-based management and policy issues that affect economics and society.
2	Hydrogeology Journal	Germany	0.94	390	Integration of subsurface hydrology and geology, geochemistry, geophysics, geomorphology, and surface-water hydrology.
3	Applied Geochemistry	United Kingdom	1.02	278	Geochemistry, urban geochemistry, environment preservation, health, waste disposal, isotope geochemistry and geochemical processes.
4	Hydrological Processes	United Kingdom	1.22	266	Movement and storage of water, and water interaction with geological, biogeochemical, atmospheric and ecological systems.
5	Environmental Earth Sciences	Germany	0.64	253	Groundwater, soil contamination, waste management, environmental problems associated with transportation by land or water-geological
6	Science of the Total Environment	Netherlands	1.8	226	Environmental topics including the atmosphere, hydrosphere, biosphere, lithosphere, and anthroposphere.
7	Water	Switzerland	0.72	127	Water resources management, water governance, hydrology and hydraulics, water scarcity, and flood risk.
8	Chemical Geology	Netherlands	1.54	126	Isotopic and elemental geochemistry, geochronology and cosmochemistry.
9	Water Resources Research	United States	1.86	126	Natural and water social sciences, water in the Earth's system, water resources research, water management, and water policy.
10	Isotopes in Environmental and Health Studies	United Kingdom	0.45	118	Natural isotope abundance, stable isotope tracer techniques, and isotope measurement methods.

Table 3. Main Information of the top 10 of the most relevant sources in GSI.

Note: R: Ranking; SJR = SCImago Journal Rank; ND: Number of Documents.



Figure 6. Co-occurrence of author keywords map in both databases (WoS y Scopus).

Table 4 summarizes the literature review conducted on the most relevant clusters (clusters from one to six with occurrence greater than 240) shown in Figure 6. This table includes the main topics emerging from each cluster.

Table 4. Keywords clusters about GSI.

Cluster	Cluster Name	Main Keywords Ocurrence	Topics	References
1	'Nitrate	Nitrate pollution (187)	Groundwater and nitrate	[171,172]
(72 nodes)	Pollution'	Denitrification (86)	Flow dynamics	[173.174]
(, = nouco)	(red)	Pollution (71)	Principal Component Analysis	
			(PCA) application	[175,176]
2	'Groundwater	Groundwater (941)	Groundwater flow in arid zones	[177–179]
2 (11 madaa)	and isotopes'	Isotopes (341)	Surface-groundwater interaction	[177,180]
(44 nodes)	(green)	Surface-water relations (88)	Remote sensing in groundwater management	[181–183]
2	/I Isa daga ala sana i stana/	Hudrochomistry (437)	Hydrochemical studies in	[104 107]
(27 nodes)	(blue)	Hydrogeochemistry (164)	surface-groundwater systems	[104-107]
(57 houes)	(blue)	Geochemistry (141)	Groundwater modelling	[188–190]
		Geoenemistry (141)	Stable and environmental	
4	'Stable and	Stable isotope (2056)	isotopes for understanding	[191–194]
(36 nodes)	Environmental	Environmental isotopes (135)	hydrological systems	
	Isotopes	Water sources (64)	Recharge and contamination	[195–197]
_	(yellow)		sources	
5	δ^{10} O and δ^2 H	$\delta^{10}O(376)$	Stable Isotopes	[198–200]
(29 nodes)	stable isotopes' (violet)	δ ² H (276) δ ³ H (127)	Environmental tracers in water quality	[201-203]
6	'Groundwater	Groundwater recharge (241)	Groundwater recharge	[204,205]
(28 nodes)	Recharge'	Groundwater age (102)	Groundwater flow	[206–208]
(20 nodes)	(light blue)	Groundwater flow (89)	Groundwater-surface water interaction	[209-211]
			Groundwater age	[212-214]
7	(Pachargo)	Recharge (204)	Recharge sources	[206,215]
(27 nodes)	(orange)	Soil water (89)	Numerical modelling	[216,217]
(27 nodes)	(orange)	Salinity (65)	Aquifer recharge	[218,219]
			Environmental tracers	[203,220]
8	'Water Stable	Water stable isotopes (90)	Groundwater-surface relation	[221-223]
(25 nodes)	Isotopes'	Hydrology (68)	Groundwater quality	[215,224,225]
(25 1100003)	(brown)	Water balance (66)	Water age	[226,227]
			Groundwater salinity	[228,229]
9	'Arid zone'	Arid zone (78)	Arid zone hydrology	[230,231]
(21 nodes)	(violet)	Sr isotopes (61)	Environmental tracers	[232,233]
			Groundwater processes	[234,235]
	'Seawater		Coastal aquifer salinization	[236-238]
10	Intrusion and coastal	Seawater intrusion (63)	Groundwater modelling	[191,239,240]
(15 nodes)	aguifers'	Coastal aguifers (62)	Groundwater exploitation	[241,242]
()	(pink)	1 ()	Urban groundwater	[243-245]
	A ,		Hydrochemical processes	[246,247]
11	'Precipitation'	Precipitation (155)	Climate variability	[248,249]
(6 nodes)	(light green)	Karst aquifer (134)	Water chemistry	[250-252]
()	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	1 . 7	Groundwater infiltration	[253-255]

Cluster 1, called 'Nitrate Pollution', is the most extensive research area, and according to the co-occurrence of terms, it is considered the eighth most crucial research group (see Figure 6). In this cluster, research trends are mainly linked to: (i) groundwater nitrate pollution sources in the agricultural area, (ii) the application of nitrogen and oxygen isotopes to identify nitrate pollution in surface water, and (iii) agricultural and urban nitrate pollution.

Cluster 2 is called 'Groundwater and isotopes'. In this cluster, future lines of research will focus on: (i) water intrusion evidence from groundwater isotopes, (ii) groundwater isotopes and their implications for recharge sources, and (iii) the use of precipitation and groundwater isotopes to interpret regional hydrology.

Cluster 3 is called 'hydrochemistry' in this cluster, and trending publications are related to the following topics: (i) modelling of hydrochemistry evolution in aquifer systems, (ii) hydrological interaction between fresh-submarine groundwater discharge and coastal groundwater, (iii) identification of sources and groundwater recharge zones from hydrochemistry and stable isotopes, and (iv) tracing nitrate sources in urban waters using hydrochemistry and stable isotopes.

Cluster 4 is called 'stable and environmental isotopes'. Future lines of research associated with this topic include: (i) determining the origin of nitrate in watersheds using environmental isotopes, (ii) hydrochemical and environmental isotope analysis for characterizing a karst aquifer system, (iii) age and origin of groundwater, and (iv) hydrochemical tracers and environmental isotopes applied to conceptual modelling.

Cluster 5 is called ' δ^{18} O and δ^{2} H stable isotopes'. In this cluster, research trends are oriented towards: (i) improving the groundwater structural characterization, (ii) understanding evaporation moisture stress in arid areas, (iii) identifying groundwater recharge sources, (iv) tracing surface and groundwater flow systems, and (v) surface water-groundwater interaction.

Clusters 6 to 11 are smaller since they contain between 6 and 28 nodes (keywords), which represents a weaker relationship with the most representative clusters (1–5). These clusters comprise the following themes: 'Groundwater recharge' (cluster 6-light blue), 'Recharge' (cluster 7-orange), 'Water Stable Isotopes' (cluster 8-brown), 'Arid zone' (cluster 9-violet), 'Seawater Intrusion and coastal aquifers' (cluster 10-pink), and 'Precipitation' (cluster 11-light green).

3.5. Future Trend Analysis

This analysis presents the frequency of the main themes that allowed for the analysis of the selected field of study's evolution (see Figure 7). This section included keywords in at least three studies, placing the node with the highest frequency in the year.



Figure 7. The trend of keywords by year of the GSI.

The most extended periods correspond to the phreatophyte (1969–2012), oxygen-18 (2003–2019), and groundwater (2002–2019) areas. In contrast, the shortest period is the critical zone (2019–2021). Additionally, the most frequent keywords are stable isotope (2012), groundwater (884), hydrochemistry (422), isotope (257), and groundwater recharge (218). Current trends are karst aquifer (21), groundwater residence time (14), and critical zone (14), which may serve as a basis for future research trends. For example, some publications identify karst recharge areas by applying isotopic and hydrogeological techniques [256,257]. They also identify the geochemical and isotopic variability in karst aquifers [258]. In addition, hydrochemical methods and stable/environmental isotopes characterize the interaction between karst water and surface water [259,260]. Finally, to develop a multicomponent reactive transport framework, the evolution of lithium isotope signatures in actively weathered drainage [261].

4. Discussion

The intellectual structure of GSI has had an evolution over 52 years thanks to the contribution of 78 countries through 13,867 authors, whose research has appeared in 6633 publications. These publications come from the Scopus and WoS databases, as they are considered relevant in the academic world [46,262]. These data reflect the relevance of the isotope issue in groundwater studies.

Stable isotope analytical methods were developed soon after the discovery of the isotopes. For example, deuterium (δ^2 H) was discovered by Harold Urey in 1934 [84,263]. Early techniques were based on determining isotopic ratios by the densimetric, gravity, electric resistivity, and pycnometer methods. The development of a usable mass spectrometer in the late 1940s and early 1950s gave a vital impulse to use stable isotope techniques in scientific studies. Furthermore, in the 1970s and previous years, hydrochemical studies played a leading role in aquifer contamination analyses [264,265], and isotopic techniques have become essential tools in the qualitative and quantitative evaluation of surface-groundwater systems [85–88]. However, the early methods of stable isotope analysis up to the 1990s were generally complicated, time-consuming procedures with relatively low precision and accuracy [266,267]. Therefore, there is minimal amount of publications on GSI in scientific databases in the period I (1969–1990), as shown Figure 2.

In the second period of scientific production in GSI, stable isotopes have increasingly been used as environmental tracers [268]. One common application uses isotope mixing models to quantify source contributions to a mixture [269]. Isotopes are also implemented in models of groundwater origin, age and evaporation [100–102,270], recharge identification in arid regions [97,99], denitrification [103–105], groundwater flow [106–112], and nitrogen-stable isotopes in estuarine food webs as a record of increasing urbanization in coastal watersheds [271,272].

Interactions between groundwater and surface water play a fundamental role in the functioning of riparian ecosystems, and this has gained more attention in the last years (period III of Figure 2). In the context of sustainable watershed management, it is crucial to understand and quantify exchange processes between groundwater and surface water [273]. Numerous methods exist for parameter estimation and process identification in aquifers and surface waters, divided into two main methods: (i) based on Darcy's law (e.g., piezometers, and pumping tests), and (ii) mass balance approaches (e.g., environmental tracers, monitoring wells) [274]. However, the transition zone has become a subject of significant research interest; thus, the need for appropriate methods applicable in this zone has evolved [275]. For regional research, large-scale techniques can be more suitable, whereas process studies may require measurements which enable high resolution. All methods have their limitations and uncertainties. However, a multi-scale approach combining multiple techniques can considerably reduce uncertainties and constrain estimates of fluxes between groundwater and surface water [274]. The isotopic techniques allow for the identifying of groundwater origin [276,277], age and direction of groundwater flow [278,279], and the surface water-groundwater interaction [280–282].

Hydrochemistry and stable isotopes are methodologies that complement each other and focus mainly on the analysis of recharge sources in surface-groundwater systems [176,183]. Environmental studies have been carried out mainly in China, the United States, Japan and Australia due to the high risk of erosion in delta areas, population growth and anthropogenic activity evidenced in changes in land use. Furthermore, several areas have not yet been studied in detail, combining many universities and students for the M.Sc. and Ph.D degrees and "virgin" research areas. For example, in the Badain Jaran desert in China, groundwater recharge sources have been determined using geochemical and isotopic techniques of environmental tracers (δ^{18} O and δ^{2} H) from the surface and groundwater [283]. In addition, there are applications of environmental tracers to hydrology in the arid zones of Australia, finding groundwater and using large floods for aquifer recharge [232]. In addition, the application of environmental tracers to investigate young groundwater systems provides the age of the groundwater and residence times [284].

The implementation of environmental isotopes of water has made it possible to identify the interaction of river-aquifer systems and recharge sources. Such is the case of the Sava river-Zagreb aquifer system in Croatia. In this study, the δ^2 H and δ^{18} O values indicated a spatial variability of the influence of individual groundwater sources within the local rainfall-aquifer and river [285]. Furthermore, the impact of coal extraction in Raigarh District, India and its interaction with the Kelo River water and groundwater has been studied. They analyzed the interaction through water level monitoring, river flow measurements, stable isotopes, and groundwater flow modelling [286]. Finally, community participation is essential in water studies. It allowed for the achieving of sustainable development in some sectors [287–291].

5. Conclusions

This study allowed us to analyse the scientific information on Groundwater and Stable Isotopes (GSI). It was necessary to unify the two most used scientific databases in bibliometric studies (Scopus and WoS). Finally, an analysis of the evolution of the theme in these three periods and a trend topics map generated in Bibliometrix was carried out. These analyses determined the emerging lines of research about GSI in recent years (2017–2021), which are mainly related to karst aquifers, groundwater residence time and critical zones. The analysis of the intellectual structure of GSI included the review of 6633 publications, 78 countries, 1085 sources (journals, and books, among others) and 13,867 authors.

This study evaluated the evolution of scientific production for 52 years through the analysis of three periods: I (1969–1990), II (1991–2005), and III (2006–2021). Periods I and II did not significantly contribute to publications because, in the past, most of a student's thesis (M.Sc. and PhD) consisted of writing a report related to their results. Thus, the researcher was not obliged to publish their work in a professional journal. Additionally, in Latin America, universities did not require their research professors to publish publications indexed in Scopus or WoS; they were mostly published in local bibliographical information systems (e.g., Latindex), whose production is not reflected in the database of this study. However, the third period reached exponential growth, representing 82.34% of the total publications because, in recent years, institutions (depending on the country and university) require at least one scientific article to graduate as an M.Sc. or Ph.D.

The main limitation of this study was that some database documents published before 1990 did not include keywords. Therefore, some terms would be lost in the thematic evolution analysis from 1969 to 1995. This work represents a contribution to the academy by:

- Exposing the study techniques and methodologies that enrich scientific knowledge about GSI. For example, the combination of hydrochemical techniques and stable isotopes of water for the recharge source identification and contamination in surface water-groundwater systems, in addition to the environmental isotopes application for the hydrological systems understanding and water quality. Finally, in the generation of conceptual models of the river-aquifer interaction, we would include the modeling of hydrological processes at the level of watersheds, aquifers, infiltration, and urban groundwater systems.
- The analysis of the publications on GSI in the period 1969–2021 allowed us to know the main applications of stable isotopes in groundwater which contribute to the approach of the conditions and characteristics of conceptual models of river-aquifer systems at the watershed level. Stable isotopes also provide insight into groundwater flow dynamics, recharge sources' identification, meteoric waters and research related to karst aquifers. In addition, they help to identify possible sources of contamination. Finally, with the intervention of radioactive isotopes such as tritium (δ³H), aquifer waters are dated, and residence times in groundwater are determined.
- Most research on GSI is conducted in China, the United States, Japan and Australia (see Table 2). It is because these countries presented a contribution from at least 65 countries, obtaining the most cited publications in the database, mainly on the following topics: residence times and flow paths of water, groundwater recharge

estimation, the occurrence of denitrification in shallow aquifers in agricultural areas, spatio-temporal evolution in stable isotopes in precipitation, and groundwater salinization. Moreover, in China, there are publications related to groundwater pollution, hydrogeochemistry characterization in arid, semi-arid zones, and human impacts on karst groundwater contamination. In the United States, there are publications about isotopic variation in groundwater; in Japan, there is research on aquifer interaction through hydrochemistry; in Australia, there is research about palaeohydrology and the investigation of groundwater/surface-water interactions. It highlighted the value

Author Contributions: Conceptualization, P.C.-M., G.H.-F., N.M.-B., F.M.-C. and L.B.-M.; methodology, P.C.-M., G.H.-F., N.M.-B., F.M.-C. and L.B.-M.; software, L.B.-M.; validation, N.M.-B. and L.B.-M. formal analysis, P.C.-M., G.H.-F., N.M.-B., F.M.-C. and L.D.-G.; investigation, F P.C.-M., G.H.-F., N.M.-B., F.M.-C., and L.B.-M.; data curation, L.B.-M.; writing—original draft preparation, P.C.-M., G.H.-F., N.M.-B., F.M.-C. and L.B.-M.; writing—review and editing, P.C.-M., G.H.-F., N.M.-B., F.M.-C. and L.B.-M.; supervision, P.C.-M., G.H.-F., N.M.-B., F.M.-C. and L.D.-G. All authors have read and agreed to the published version of the manuscript.

of scientific databases that show relevant information contributing to integrated water

Funding: The APC was funded by ESPOL Polytechnic University. The financial support of this article is in charge of next projects: (i) Registro del Patrimonio Geológico y Minero y su incidencia en la defensa y preservación de la geodiversidad en Ecuador (Registry of Geological and Mining Heritage and its impact on the defense and preservation of geodiversity in Ecuador), with code No. CIPAT-01-2018, (ii) Siembra y Cosecha de Agua ante el COVID-19, Manglaralto 2022 (Sowing and Harvesting of Water before COVID-19, Manglaralto 2022), with code No. PG03-PY22-03, and (iii) Gestión y Evaluación de la Investigación Científica en Ciencias de la Tierra, Economía, Administración y sus vínculos con la sociedad (Management and Evaluation of Scientific Research in Earth Sciences, Economy, Administration and its links with society), with code No. CIPAT-7-2022.

Institutional Review Board Statement: Not applicable.

Informed Consent Statement: Not applicable.

resources management.

Data Availability Statement: Not applicable.

Acknowledgments: The authors would also like to thank the editorial office for the editorial handling and the two anonymous reviewers for the valuable observations that helped improve this research's quality. The authors thank to the project "Desarrollar y Gestionar las Planicies Inundables en un Contexto Global (COSTEA)", with code No. FCV-24-2021, and his coordinator Eduardo Rodríguez.

Conflicts of Interest: The authors declare that they have no conflicts of interest.

References

- 1. Aykut, T. Determination of groundwater potential zones using Geographical Information Systems (GIS) and Analytic Hierarchy Process (AHP) between Edirne-Kalkansogut (northwestern Turkey). *Groundw. Sustain. Dev.* **2021**, *12*, 100545. [CrossRef]
- Gorelick, S.M.; Zheng, C. Global change and the groundwater management challenge. *Water Resour. Res.* 2015, *51*, 3031–3051. [CrossRef]
- 3. Margat, J.; van der Gun, J. Groundwater around the World; CRC Press: Boca Raton, FL, USA, 2013; ISBN 9780203772140.
- De Chaisemartin, M.; Varady, R.G.; Megdal, S.B.; Conti, K.I.; van der Gun, J.; Merla, A.; Nijsten, G.-J.; Scheibler, F. Addressing the Groundwater Governance Challenge. In *Freshwater Governance for the 21st Century*; Springer: Cham, Switzerland, 2017; pp. 205–227.
- 5. Xiao, Y.; Hao, Q.; Zhang, Y.; Zhu, Y.; Yin, S.; Qin, L.; Li, X. Investigating sources, driving forces and potential health risks of nitrate and fluoride in groundwater of a typical alluvial fan plain. *Sci. Total Environ.* **2022**, *802*, 149909. [CrossRef]
- Moraes-Santos, E.C.; Dias, R.A.; Balestieri, J.A.P. Groundwater and the water-food-energy nexus: The grants for water resources use and its importance and necessity of integrated management. *Land Use Policy* 2021, 109, 105585. [CrossRef]
- Xiao, Y.; Liu, K.; Hao, Q.; Li, Y.; Xiao, D.; Zhang, Y. Occurrence, Controlling Factors and Health Hazards of Fluoride-Enriched Groundwater in the Lower Flood Plain of Yellow River, Northern China. *Expo. Health* 2022, 14, 345–358. [CrossRef]
- 8. Sarah, S.; Ahmed, S.; Violette, S.; de Marsily, G. Groundwater sustainability challenges revealed by quantification of contaminated groundwater volume and aquifer depletion in hard rock aquifer systems. *J. Hydrol.* **2021**, 597, 126286. [CrossRef]

- Almanza Tovar, O.G.; Ramos Leal, J.A.; Tuxpan Vargas, J.; de Jesús Hernández García, G.; De Lara Bashulto, J. Contrast of aquifer vulnerability and water quality indices between a unconfined aquifer and a deep aquifer in arid zones. *Bull. Eng. Geol. Environ.* 2020, 79, 4579–4593. [CrossRef]
- Xiao, Y.; Liu, K.; Hao, Q.; Xiao, D.; Zhu, Y.; Yin, S.; Zhang, Y. Hydrogeochemical insights into the signatures, genesis and sustainable perspective of nitrate enriched groundwater in the piedmont of Hutuo watershed, China. *CATENA* 2022, 212, 106020. [CrossRef]
- Carballo, F.M.; Brito, L.M.; Mero, P.C.; Aguilar, M.A.; Ramírez, J.T. Urban Wastewater Treatment Through A System of Green Filters in the Montañita Commune, Santa Elena, Ecuador. In WIT Transactions on Ecology and the Environment; WIT Press: Billerica, MA, USA, 2019; pp. 233–249.
- Polo, J.F. Recycling and Reuse of Treated Wastewater: Challenges and Perspectives—The Example of the Júcar River Basin District and the Albufera Lake. In *Integrated Water Resources Management in the Mediterranean Region*; Springer: Dordrecht, The Netherlands, 2012; pp. 195–219.
- 13. Maceda-Veiga, A.; Mac Nally, R.; de Sostoa, A. Water-quality impacts in semi-arid regions: Can natural 'green filters' mitigate adverse effects on fish assemblages? *Water Res.* **2018**, *144*, 628–641. [CrossRef]
- 14. Vaux, H. Groundwater under stress: The importance of management. Environ. Earth Sci. 2011, 62, 19–23. [CrossRef]
- 15. Greve, P.; Kahil, T.; Mochizuki, J.; Schinko, T.; Satoh, Y.; Burek, P.; Fischer, G.; Tramberend, S.; Burtscher, R.; Langan, S.; et al. Global assessment of water challenges under uncertainty in water scarcity projections. *Nat. Sustain.* **2018**, *1*, 486–494. [CrossRef]
- Herrera-Franco, G.; Carrión-Mero, P.; Aguilar-Aguilar, M.; Morante-Carballo, F.; Jaya-Montalvo, M.; Morillo-Balsera, M.C.C. Groundwater resilience assessment in a communal coastal aquifer system. The case of Manglaralto in Santa Elena, Ecuador. Sustainability 2020, 12, 8290. [CrossRef]
- 17. Toth, J. Gravitational Systems of Groundwater Flow; Cambridge University Press: Cambridge, UK, 2009; ISBN 9780511576546.
- 18. Fleckenstein, J.H.; Krause, S.; Hannah, D.M.; Boano, F. Groundwater-surface water interactions: New methods and models to improve understanding of processes and dynamics. *Adv. Water Resour.* **2010**, *33*, 1291–1295. [CrossRef]
- 19. Guevara Ochoa, C.; Medina Sierra, A.; Vives, L.; Zimmermann, E.; Bailey, R. Spatio-temporal patterns of the interaction between groundwater and surface water in plains. *Hydrol. Process.* **2020**, *34*, 1371–1392. [CrossRef]
- Adams, S.; Titus, R.; Pietersen, K.; Tredoux, G.; Harris, C. Hydrochemical characteristics of aquifers near Sutherland in the Western Karoo, South Africa. J. Hydrol. 2001, 241, 91–103. [CrossRef]
- 21. Duque, C.; Jessen, S.; Tirado-Conde, J.; Karan, S.; Engesgaard, P. Application of Stable Isotopes of Water to Study Coupled Submarine Groundwater Discharge and Nutrient Delivery. *Water* **2019**, *11*, 1842. [CrossRef]
- 22. Sophocleous, M. Interactions between groundwater and surface water: The state of the science. *Hydrogeol. J.* **2002**, *10*, 52–67. [CrossRef]
- Hokanson, K.J.; Mendoza, C.A.; Devito, K.J. Interactions between Regional Climate, Surficial Geology, and Topography: Characterizing Shallow Groundwater Systems in Subhumid, Low-Relief Landscapes. Water Resour. Res. 2019, 55, 284–297. [CrossRef]
- Chen, L.; Yin, X.; Xie, W.; Feng, X. Calculating groundwater mixing ratios in groundwater-inrushing aquifers based on environmental stable isotopes (D, ¹⁸O) and hydrogeochemistry. *Nat. Hazards* 2014, *71*, 937–953. [CrossRef]
- Li, P.; Wu, J.; Qian, H.; Zhang, Y.; Yang, N.; Jing, L.; Yu, P. Hydrogeochemical Characterization of Groundwater in and around a Wastewater Irrigated Forest in the Southeastern Edge of the Tengger Desert, Northwest China. *Expo. Health* 2016, *8*, 331–348. [CrossRef]
- 26. Dawson, T.E.; Simonin, K.A. The Roles of Stable Isotopes in Forest Hydrology and Biogeochemistry. In *Forest Hydrology and Biogeochemistry*; Delphis, F.L., Darryl Carlyle-Moses, T.T., Eds.; Springer: Berlin/Heidelberg, Germany, 2011; pp. 137–161.
- Marty, B.; Avice, G.; Sano, Y.; Altwegg, K.; Balsiger, H.; Hässig, M.; Morbidelli, A.; Mousis, O.; Rubin, M. Origins of volatile elements (H, C, N, noble gases) on Earth and Mars in light of recent results from the ROSETTA cometary mission. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 2016, 441, 91–102. [CrossRef]
- Holland, H.D.; Turekian, K.K. Treatise on Geochemistry, 2nd ed.; Elsevier Science: Amsterdam, The Netherlands, 2014; ISBN 978-0-08-098300-4.
- 29. Liu, Y.; Yamanaka, T. Tracing groundwater recharge sources in a mountain-plain transitional area using stable isotopes and hydrochemistry. *J. Hydrol.* **2012**, *464*–465, 116–126. [CrossRef]
- Negrel, P.; Pauwels, H.; Dewandel, B.; Gandolfi, J.M.; Mascré, C.; Ahmed, S. Understanding groundwater systems and their functioning through the study of stable water isotopes in a hard-rock aquifer (Maheshwaram watershed, India). *J. Hydrol.* 2011, 397, 55–70. [CrossRef]
- Xiao, Y.; Shao, J.; Frape, S.K.; Cui, Y.; Dang, X.; Wang, S.; Ji, Y. Groundwater origin, flow regime and geochemical evolution in arid endorheic watersheds: A case study from the Qaidam Basin, northwestern China. *Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci.* 2018, 22, 4381–4400. [CrossRef]
- Fackrell, J.K.; Glenn, C.R.; Thomas, D.; Whittier, R.; Popp, B.N. Stable isotopes of precipitation and groundwater provide new insight into groundwater recharge and flow in a structurally complex hydrogeologic system: West Hawai'i, USA [Nouvelles informations fournies à pa]. *Hydrogeol. J.* 2020, 28, 1191–1207. [CrossRef]
- Galbán-Rodríguez, E.; Torres-Ponjuán, D.; Martí-Lahera, Y.; Arencibia-Jorge, R. Measuring the Cuban scientific output in scholarly journals through a comprehensive coverage approach. *Scientometrics* 2019, 121, 1019–1043. [CrossRef]
- 34. Merigó, J.M.; Yang, J.-B. A bibliometric analysis of operations research and management science. Omega 2017, 73, 37–48. [CrossRef]

- Herrera-Franco, G.; Montalván-Burbano, N.; Carrión-Mero, P.; Bravo-Montero, L. Worldwide Research on Socio-Hydrology: A Bibliometric Analysis. Water 2021, 13, 1283. [CrossRef]
- 36. Donthu, N.; Kumar, S.; Mukherjee, D.; Pandey, N.; Lim, W.M. How to conduct a bibliometric analysis: An overview and guidelines. *J. Bus. Res.* **2021**, 133, 285–296. [CrossRef]
- Jiang, Y.; Ritchie, B.W.; Benckendorff, P. Bibliometric visualisation: An application in tourism crisis and disaster management research. *Curr. Issues Tour.* 2019, 22, 1925–1957. [CrossRef]
- Yu, Y.; Jin, Z.; Qiu, J. Global Isotopic Hydrograph Separation Research History and Trends: A Text Mining and Bibliometric Analysis Study. *Water* 2021, 13, 2529. [CrossRef]
- Tatry, M.-V.; Fournier, D.; Jeannequin, B.; Dosba, F. EU27 and USA leadership in fruit and vegetable research: A bibliometric study from 2000 to 2009. *Scientometrics* 2014, 98, 2207–2222. [CrossRef]
- 40. Zhang, J.Z.; Srivastava, P.R.; Sharma, D.; Eachempati, P. Big data analytics and machine learning: A retrospective overview and bibliometric analysis. *Expert Syst. Appl.* **2021**, *184*, 115561. [CrossRef]
- Leitão, J.; Pereira, D.; Gonçalves, Â. Business Incubators, Accelerators, and Performance of Technology-Based Ventures: A Systematic Literature Review. J. Open Innov. Technol. Mark. Complex. 2022, 8, 46. [CrossRef]
- Morante-Carballo, F.; Montalván-Burbano, N.; Quiñonez-Barzola, X.; Jaya-Montalvo, M.; Carrión-Mero, P. What Do We Know about Water Scarcity in Semi-Arid Zones? A Global Analysis and Research Trends. Water 2022, 14, 2685. [CrossRef]
- Sánchez, A.D.; de la Cruz Del Río-Rama, M.; García, J.Á. Bibliometric analysis of publications on wine tourism in the databases Scopus and WoS. *Eur. Res. Manag. Bus. Econ.* 2017, 23, 8–15. [CrossRef]
- 44. Maia, S.C.; de Benedicto, G.C.; do Prado, J.W.; Robb, D.A.; de Almeida Bispo, O.N.; de Brito, M.J. Mapping the literature on credit unions: A bibliometric investigation grounded in Scopus and Web of Science. *Scientometrics* **2019**, *120*, 929–960. [CrossRef]
- Martín-Martín, A.; Thelwall, M.; Orduna-Malea, E.; Delgado López-Cózar, E. Google Scholar, Microsoft Academic, Scopus, Dimensions, Web of Science, and OpenCitations' COCI: A multidisciplinary comparison of coverage via citations. *Scientometrics* 2021, 126, 871–906. [CrossRef]
- 46. Mongeon, P.; Paul-Hus, A. The journal coverage of Web of Science and Scopus: A comparative analysis. *Scientometrics* **2016**, *106*, 213–228. [CrossRef]
- 47. Salmerón-Manzano, E.; Manzano-Agugliaro, F. Worldwide Scientific Production Indexed by Scopus on Labour Relations. *Publications* **2017**, *5*, 25. [CrossRef]
- 48. Xu, X.; Chen, X.; Jia, F.; Brown, S.; Gong, Y.; Xu, Y. Supply chain finance: A systematic literature review and bibliometric analysis. *Int. J. Prod. Econ.* **2018**, 204, 160–173. [CrossRef]
- 49. Hallinger, P.; Nguyen, V.-T. Mapping the Landscape and Structure of Research on Education for Sustainable Development: A Bibliometric Review. *Sustainability* **2020**, *12*, 1947. [CrossRef]
- 50. López-Illescas, C.; de Moya-Anegón, F.; Moed, H.F. Coverage and citation impact of oncological journals in the Web of Science and Scopus. J. Informetr. 2008, 2, 304–316. [CrossRef]
- 51. Aria, M.; Cuccurullo, C. bibliometrix : An R-tool for comprehensive science mapping analysis. J. Informetr. 2017, 11, 959–975. [CrossRef]
- 52. Basu, T.; Das, A. Identification of backward district in India by applying the principal component analysis and fuzzy approach: A census based study. *Socioecon. Plann. Sci.* 2020, 72, 100915. [CrossRef]
- Komperda, R. Likert-Type Survey Data Analysis with R and RStudio. In *Computer-Aided Data Analysis in Chemical Education Research (CADACER): Advances and Avenues;* Gupta, T., Ed.; ACS Symposium Series: Washington, DC, USA, 2017; pp. 91–116. ISBN 978-0841232440.
- 54. Rodríguez-Iznaga, I.; Petranovskii, V.; Chávez-Rivas, F.; Shelyapina, M.G. Bimetallic Copper-Silver Systems Supported on Natural Clinoptilolite: Long-Term Changes in Nanospecies' Composition and Stability. *Inorganics* **2022**, *10*, 34. [CrossRef]
- Flores-Romero, M.B.; Pérez-Romero, M.E.; Álvarez-García, J.; de la Cruz Del Río-Rama, M. Bibliometric Mapping of Research on Magic Towns of Mexico. *Land* 2021, 10, 852. [CrossRef]
- Morante-Carballo, F.; Montalván-Burbano, N.; Arias-Hidalgo, M.; Domínguez-Granda, L.; Apolo-Masache, B.; Carrión-Mero, P. Flood Models: An Exploratory Analysis and Research Trends. *Water* 2022, 14, 2488. [CrossRef]
- 57. Aria, M.; Misuraca, M.; Spano, M. Mapping the Evolution of Social Research and Data Science on 30 Years of Social Indicators Research. *Soc. Indic. Res.* 2020, *149*, 803–831. [CrossRef]
- 58. Herrera-Franco, G.; Carrión-Mero, P.; Montalván-Burbano, N.; Mora-Frank, C.; Berrezueta, E. Bibliometric Analysis of Groundwater's Life Cycle Assessment Research. *Water* **2022**, *14*, 1082. [CrossRef]
- 59. Van Eck, N.J.; Waltman, L. Software survey: VOSviewer, a computer program for bibliometric mapping. *Scientometrics* **2010**, *84*, 523–538. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- Van Eck, N.J.; Waltman, L. Visualizing Bibliometric Networks. In *Measuring Scholarly Impact*; Springer International Publishing: Cham, Switzerland, 2014; pp. 285–320.
- Maldonado-Erazo, C.P.; Álvarez-García, J.; de la Cruz Del Río-Rama, M.; Durán-Sánchez, A. Scientific Mapping on the Impact of Climate Change on Cultural and Natural Heritage: A Systematic Scientometric Analysis. Land 2021, 10, 76. [CrossRef]
- 62. George, T.T.; Obilana, A.O.; Oyenihi, A.B.; Rautenbach, F.G. Moringa oleifera through the years: A bibliometric analysis of scientific research (2000–2020). *S. Afr. J. Bot.* 2021, 141, 12–24. [CrossRef]

- 63. Niu, B.; Loáiciga, H.A.; Wang, Z.; Zhan, F.B.; Hong, S. Twenty years of global groundwater research: A Science Citation Index Expanded-based bibliometric survey (1993–2012). *J. Hydrol.* **2014**, *519*, 966–975. [CrossRef]
- 64. Zhang, S.; Mao, G.; Crittenden, J.; Liu, X.; Du, H. Groundwater remediation from the past to the future: A bibliometric analysis. *Water Res.* **2017**, *119*, 114–125. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 65. Morante-Carballo, F.; Montalván-Burbano, N.; Carrión-Mero, P.; Jácome-Francis, K. Worldwide research analysis on natural zeolites as environmental remediation materials. *Sustainability* **2021**, *13*, 6378. [CrossRef]
- 66. ESRI ArcGIS Desktop. Available online: https://www.esri.com/en-us/arcgis/products/arcgis-pro/overview (accessed on 2 February 2022).
- 67. Noyons, E.C.M.; Moed, H.F.; van Raan, A.F.J. Integrating research performance analysis and science mapping. *Scientometrics* **1999**, 46, 591–604. [CrossRef]
- 68. Moral-Muñoz, J.A.; Herrera-Viedma, E.; Santisteban-Espejo, A.; Cobo, M.J. Software tools for conducting bibliometric analysis in science: An up-to-date review. *Prof. Inf.* 2020, 29, 1–20. [CrossRef]
- 69. Mas-Tur, A.; Kraus, S.; Brandtner, M.; Ewert, R.; Kürsten, W. Advances in management research: A bibliometric overview of the Review of Managerial Science. *Rev. Manag. Sci.* 2020, *14*, 933–958. [CrossRef]
- 70. Abad-Segura, E.; de la Fuente, A.B.; González-Zamar, M.-D.; Belmonte-Ureña, L.J. Effects of Circular Economy Policies on the Environment and Sustainable Growth: Worldwide Research. *Sustainability* **2020**, *12*, 5792. [CrossRef]
- Linnenluecke, M.K.; Marrone, M.; Singh, A.K. Conducting systematic literature reviews and bibliometric analyses. *Aust. J. Manag.* 2020, 45, 175–194. [CrossRef]
- Marchiori, D.; Franco, M. Knowledge transfer in the context of inter-organizational networks: Foundations and intellectual structures. J. Innov. Knowl. 2020, 5, 130–139. [CrossRef]
- 73. Tranfield, D.; Denyer, D.; Smart, P. Towards a Methodology for Developing Evidence-Informed Management Knowledge by Means of Systematic Review. *Br. J. Manag.* 2003, 14, 207–222. [CrossRef]
- Higgins, J.; Green, S. Cochrane Handbook for Systematic Reviews of Interventions; Higgins, J.P.T., Thomas, J., Chandler, J., Cumpston, M., Li, T., Page, M.J., Welch, V.A., Eds.; Wiley: Hoboken, NJ, USA, 2019; ISBN 9781119536628.
- 75. Mentzer, J.; Kahn, K. A framework of logistics research. J. Bus. Logist. 1995, 16, 231–250.
- Fahimnia, B.; Sarkis, J.; Davarzani, H. Green supply chain management: A review and bibliometric analysis. *Int. J. Prod. Econ.* 2015, 162, 101–114. [CrossRef]
- 77. Denyer, D.; Tranfield, D. Producing a systematic review. In *The Sage Handbook of Organizational Research Methods*; Sage Publications Ltd.: London, UK, 2009; pp. 671–689. ISBN 8003742722.
- 78. Morante-Carballo, F.; Montalván-Burbano, N.; Carrión-Mero, P.; Espinoza-Santos, N. Cation exchange of natural zeolites: Worldwide research. *Sustainability* **2021**, *13*, 7751. [CrossRef]
- 79. Solla-Price, J.D. Little Science, Big Science; Columbia University Press: New York, NY, USA, 1963.
- 80. Arthur, M.B.; Rousseau, D.M. A Career Lexicon for the 21st Century. Acad. Manag. Perspect. 1996, 10, 28–39. [CrossRef]
- Andreo-Martínez, P.; Ortiz-Martínez, V.M.; García-Martínez, N.; de los Ríos, A.P.; Hernández-Fernández, F.J.; Quesada-Medina, J. Production of biodiesel under supercritical conditions: State of the art and bibliometric analysis. *Appl. Energy* 2020, 264, 114753. [CrossRef]
- Ho, Y.-S.; Satoh, H.; Lin, S.-Y. Japanese Lung Cancer Research Trends and Performance in Science Citation Index. *Intern. Med.* 2010, 49, 2219–2228. [CrossRef]
- Waltman, L.; van Eck, N.J.; Noyons, E.C.M. A unified approach to mapping and clustering of bibliometric networks. *J. Informetr.* 2010, 4, 629–635. [CrossRef]
- 84. Mattauch, J.; Herzog, R. Uber einen neuen Massenspektrographen. Z. Phys. 1934, 89, 786–795. [CrossRef]
- 85. Ahmad, M.; Green, D.C. Groundwater regimes and isotopic studies, Ranger mine area, Northern Territory. *Aust. J. Earth Sci.* **1986**, 33, 391–399. [CrossRef]
- Heathcote, J.A.; Lloyd, J.W. Factors affecting the isotopic composition of daily rainfall at Driby, Lincolnshire. J. Climatol. 1986, 6, 97–106. [CrossRef]
- 87. Alpers, C.N.; Whittemore, D.O. Hydrogeochemistry and stable isotopes of ground and surface waters from two adjacent closed basins, Atacama Desert, northern Chile. *Appl. Geochem.* **1990**, *5*, 719–734. [CrossRef]
- Bassett, R.L. A critical evaluation of the available measurements for the stable isotopes of boron. *Appl. Geochem.* 1990, *5*, 541–554. [CrossRef]
- 89. Gat, J.R.; Mazor, E.; Tzur, Y. The stable isotope composition of mineral waters in the Jordan Rift Valley, Israel. J. Hydrol. 1969, 7, 334–352. [CrossRef]
- 90. Allan, J.R.; Matthews, R.K. Isotope signatures associated with early meteoric diagenesis. *Sedimentology* **1982**, *29*, 797–817. [CrossRef]
- 91. Małoszewski, P.; Zuber, A. Determining the turnover time of groundwater systems with the aid of environmental tracers. 1. Models and their applicability. *J. Hydrol.* **1982**, *57*, 207–231. [CrossRef]
- 92. Rozanski, K.; Sonntag, C.; Munnich, K.O. Factors controlling stable isotope composition of European precipitation. *Tellus* **1982**, *34*, 142–150. [CrossRef]
- 93. Egeberg, P.K.; Aagaard, P. Origin and evolution of formation waters from oil fields on the Norwegian shelf. *Appl. Geochem.* **1989**, *4*, 131–142. [CrossRef]

- 94. Searl, A. Diagenesis of the Gully Oolite (Lower Carboniferous), South Wales. Geol. J. 1989, 24, 275–293. [CrossRef]
- Edmunds, W.M.; Cook, J.M.; Darling, W.G.; Kinniburgh, D.G.; Miles, D.L.; Bath, A.H.; Morgan-Jones, M.; Andrews, J.N. Baseline geochemical conditions in the Chalk aquifer, Berkshire, U.K.: A basis for groundwater quality management. *Appl. Geochem.* 1987, 2, 251–274. [CrossRef]
- 96. Dawson, T.E. Determining water use by trees and forests from isotopic, energy balance and transpiration analyses: The roles of tree size and hydraulic lift. *Tree Physiol.* **1996**, *16*, 263–272. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- Cunningham, E.E.B.; Long, A.; Eastoe, C.; Bassett, R.L. Migration of recharge waters downgradient from the Santa Catalina Mountains into the Tucson basin aquifer, Arizona, USA. *Hydrogeol. J.* 1998, 6, 94–103. [CrossRef]
- Mahlknecht, J.; Schneider, J.F.; Merkel, B.J.; Navarro de Leon, I.; Bernasconi, S.M.; de Leon, I.N.; Bernasconi, S.M. Groundwater recharge in a sedimentary basin in semi-arid Mexico. *Hydrogeol. J.* 2004, *12*, 511–530. [CrossRef]
- 99. Subyani, A.M. Use of chloride-mass balance and environmental isotopes for evaluation of groundwater recharge in the alluvial aquifer, Wadi Tharad, western Saudi Arabia. *Environ. Geol.* **2004**, *46*, 741–749. [CrossRef]
- 100. Jahren, A.H.; Sanford, K.L. Ground-water is the ultimate source of the Salt Creek pupfish habitat, Death Valley, USA. J. Arid Environ. 2002, 51, 401–411. [CrossRef]
- Drake, P.L.; Franks, P.J. Water resource partitioning, stem xylem hydraulic properties, and plant water use strategies in a seasonally dry riparian tropical rainforest. *Oecologia* 2003, 137, 321–329. [CrossRef]
- 102. Calf, G.E.; McDonald, P.S.; Jacobsons, G. Recharge mechanism and groundwater age in the Ti-Tree Basin, Northern Territory. *Aust. J. Earth Sci.* **1991**, *38*, 299–306. [CrossRef]
- 103. Kellman, L.M.; Hillaire-Marcel, C. Evaluation of nitrogen isotopes as indicators of nitrate contamination sources in an agricultural watershed. *Agric. Ecosyst. Environ.* **2003**, *95*, 87–102. [CrossRef]
- 104. Lund, L.; Horne, A.; Williams, A. Estimating denitrification in a large constructed wetland using stable nitrogen isotope ratios. *Ecol. Eng.* **1999**, *14*, 67–76. [CrossRef]
- 105. Chen, D.J.Z.; MacQuarrie, K.T.B. Correlation of δ¹⁵N and δ¹⁸O in NO₃⁻ during denitrification in groundwater. *J. Environ. Eng. Sci.* 2005, 4, 221–226. [CrossRef]
- 106. Salem, Z.E.; Sakura, Y.; Aslam, M.A.M. The use of temperature, stable isotopes and water quality to determine the pattern and spatial extent of groundwater flow: Nagaoka area, Japan. *Hydrogeol. J.* 2004, 12, 563–575. [CrossRef]
- 107. Chen, J.; Tang, C.; Sakura, Y.; Kondoh, A.; Yu, J.; Shimada, J.; Tanaka, T. Spatial geochemical and isotopic characteristics associated with groundwater flow in the North China Plain. *Hydrol. Process.* **2004**, *18*, 3133–3146. [CrossRef]
- Uchida, Y.; Hayashi, T. Effects of hydrogeological and climate change on the subsurface thermal regime in the Sendai Plain. *Phys. Earth Planet. Inter.* 2005, 152, 292–304. [CrossRef]
- Mathieu, R.; Bariac, T. An isotopic study (²H and ¹⁸O) of water movements in clayey soils under a semiarid climate. *Water Resour. Res.* 1996, 32, 779–789. [CrossRef]
- Hunt, R.J.; Krabbenhoft, D.P.; Anderson, M.P. Groundwater inflow measurements in wetland systems. Water Resour. Res. 1996, 32, 495–507. [CrossRef]
- 111. Johannesson, K.H.; Stetzenbach, K.J.; Hodge, V.F.; Kreamer, D.K.; Zhou, X. Delineation of Ground-Water Flow Systems in the Southern Great Basin Using Aqueous Rare Earth Element Distributions. *Ground Water* **1997**, *35*, 807–819. [CrossRef]
- Gehrels, J.C.; Peeters, J.E.M.; De Vries, J.J.; Dekkers, M. The mechanism of soil water movement as inferred from ¹⁸O stable isotope studies. [Mécanisme du mouvement des eaux souterraines d'après les conclusions des études de l'isotope stable ¹⁸O]. *Hydrol. Sci. J.* **1998**, 43, 579–594. [CrossRef]
- 113. Zhou, J.; Liu, G.; Meng, Y.; Xia, C.C.; Chen, K. Characteristics of δ^{18} O and δ^{2} H and their implication for the interaction between precipitation, groundwater and river water in the upper river tuojiang, southwest China. *Water Pract. Technol.* **2021**, *16*, 226–246. [CrossRef]
- 114. Toetz, D. Nitrate in ground and surface waters in the vicinity of a concentrated animal feeding operation. *Arch. Fur Hydrobiol.* **2006**, *166*, 67–77. [CrossRef]
- 115. Gurwick, N.P.; Groffman, P.M.; Yavitt, J.B.; Gold, A.J.; Blazejewski, G.; Stolt, M. Microbially available carbon in buried riparian soils in a glaciated landscape. *Soil Biol. Biochem.* **2008**, *40*, 85–96. [CrossRef]
- 116. Jonsson, C.E.; Leng, M.J.; Rosqvist, G.C.; Seibert, J.; Arrowsmith, C. Stable oxygen and hydrogen isotopes in sub-Arctic lake waters from northern Sweden. *J. Hydrol.* **2009**, *376*, 143–151. [CrossRef]
- 117. Mohammadi, Z.; Zare, M.; Sharifzade, B. Delineation of groundwater salinization in a coastal aquifer, Bousheher, South of Iran. *Environ. Earth Sci.* **2012**, *67*, 1473–1484. [CrossRef]
- 118. Faye, S.; Maloszewski, P.; Stichler, W.; Trimborn, P.; Cissé Faye, S.; Bécaye Gaye, C. Groundwater salinization in the Saloum (Senegal) delta aquifer: Minor elements and isotopic indicators. *Sci. Total Environ.* **2005**, *343*, 243–259. [CrossRef]
- 119. Matheson, E.J.; Hamilton, S.M.; Kyser, K. Shallow groundwater salinization of the niagara peninsula, Ontario, Canada. *Geochem. Explor. Environ. Anal.* **2018**, *18*, 155–174. [CrossRef]
- Carrión-Mero, P.; Montalván, F.J.; Morante-Carballo, F.; Heredia, J.; Elorza, F.J.; Solórzano, J.; Aguilera, H. Hydrochemical and isotopic characterization of the waters of the Manglaralto river basin (Ecuador) to contribute to the management of the coastal aquifer. *Water* 2021, 13, 537. [CrossRef]

- Akpataku, K.V.; Rai, S.P.; Gnazou, M.D.-T.; Tampo, L.; Bawa, L.M.; Djaneye-Boundjou, G.; Faye, S. Hydrochemical and isotopic characterization of groundwater in the southeastern part of the Plateaux Region, Togo. *Hydrol. Sci. J.* 2019, 64, 983–1000. [CrossRef]
- 122. Han, Y.; Zhai, Y.; Guo, M.; Cao, X.; Lu, H.; Li, J.; Wang, S.; Yue, W. Hydrochemical and isotopic characterization of the impact of water diversion on water in drainage channels, groundwater, and lake ulansuhai in China. *Water* **2021**, *13*, 3033. [CrossRef]
- 123. Swarzenski, P.W.; Baskaran, M.; Rosenbauer, R.J.; Edwards, B.D.; Land, M. A combined radio- and stable-isotopic study of a California coastal aquifer system. *Water* **2013**, *5*, 480–504. [CrossRef]
- 124. Bakari, S.S.; Aagaard, P.; Vogt, R.D.; Ruden, F.; Brennwald, M.S.; Johansen, I.; Gulliksen, S. Groundwater residence time and paleorecharge conditions in the deep confined aquifers of the coastal watershed, South-East Tanzania. *J. Hydrol.* **2012**, 466–467, 127–140. [CrossRef]
- 125. Vera, A.; Pino-Vargas, E.; Verma, M.P.; Chucuya, S.; Chávarri, E.; Canales, M.; Torres-Martínez, J.A.; Mora, A.; Mahlknecht, J. Hydrodynamics, hydrochemistry, and stable isotope geochemistry to assess temporal behavior of seawater intrusion in the la yarada aquifer in the vicinity of atacama desert, tacna, peru. *Water* **2021**, *13*, 3161. [CrossRef]
- 126. Mulholland, P.J.; Helton, A.M.; Poole, G.C.; Hall, R.O., Jr.; Hamilton, S.K.; Peterson, B.J.; Tank, J.L.; Ashkenas, L.R.; Cooper, L.W.; Dahm, C.N.; et al. Stream denitrification across biomes and its response to anthropogenic nitrate loading. *Nature* 2008, 452, 202–205. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 127. Burgin, A.J.; Hamilton, S.K. Have we overemphasized the role of denitrification in aquatic ecosystems? A review of nitrate removal pathways. *Front. Ecol. Environ.* **2007**, *5*, 89–96. [CrossRef]
- 128. Lei, L.; Liu, D. The research trends and contributions of System's publications over the past four decades (1973–2017): A bibliometric analysis. *System* 2019, *80*, 1–13. [CrossRef]
- 129. Garrigos-Simon, F.J.; Narangajavana-Kaosiri, Y.; Narangajavana, Y. Quality in Tourism Literature: A Bibliometric Review. *Sustainability* **2019**, *11*, 3859. [CrossRef]
- 130. Gates, J.B.; Scanlon, B.R.; Mu, X.; Zhang, L. Impacts of soil conservation on groundwater recharge in the semi-arid Loess Plateau, China. *Hydrogeol. J.* **2011**, *19*, 865–875. [CrossRef]
- 131. Wu, H.; Wang, L.; Liu, L.; Hao, L.; Ma, Q.; Li, F.; Guo, L.; Zhang, X.; Zheng, Y. Groundwater recharge and evolution in the Wuwei Basin, northwestern China. *Environ. Earth Sci.* **2019**, *78*, 366. [CrossRef]
- 132. Xu, W.; Su, X.; Dai, Z.; Yang, F.; Zhu, P.; Huang, Y. Multi-tracer investigation of river and groundwater interactions: A case study in Nalenggele River basin, northwest China. [Investigations multitraceurs des interactions nappes-rivières: Cas d'étude du bassin de la rivière Nalenggele, nord-ouest de la Chin. *Hydrogeol. J.* **2017**, *25*, 2015–2029. [CrossRef]
- 133. Zhu, M.; Wang, S.; Kong, X.; Zheng, W.; Feng, W.; Zhang, X.; Yuan, R.; Song, X.; Sprenger, M. Interaction of surface water and groundwater influenced by groundwater over-extraction, waste water discharge and water transfer in Xiong'an New Area, China. *Water* **2019**, *11*, 539. [CrossRef]
- Liu, F.; Wang, S.; Wang, L.; Shi, L.; Song, X.; Yeh, T.-C.J.; Zhen, P. Coupling hydrochemistry and stable isotopes to identify the major factors affecting groundwater geochemical evolution in the Heilongdong Spring Basin, North China. *J. Geochem. Explor.* 2019, 205, 106352. [CrossRef]
- 135. Chen, L.; Ma, T.; Du, Y.; Xiao, C.; Chen, X.; Liu, C.; Wang, Y. Hydrochemical and isotopic (²H, ¹⁸O and ³⁷Cl) constraints on evolution of geothermal water in coastal plain of Southwestern Guangdong Province, China. J. Volcanol. Geotherm. Res. 2016, 318, 45–54. [CrossRef]
- 136. Congjian, S.; Weihong, L.; Yaning, C.; Xingong, L.; Yuhui, Y. Isotopic and hydrochemical composition of runoff in the Urumqi River, Tianshan Mountains, China. *Environ. Earth Sci.* **2015**, *74*, 1521–1537. [CrossRef]
- 137. Davisson, M.L.; Rose, T.P.; Smith, D.K.; Kenneally, J. Reply [to "Comment on 'Isotope hydrology of southern Nevada groundwater: Stable isotopes and radiocarbon' by M. L. Davisson et al."]. *Water Resour. Res.* **1999**, *35*, 3581–3583. [CrossRef]
- Thomas, J.M. Comment on "Isotope hydrology of southern Nevada groundwater: Stable isotopes and radiocarbon" by M. L. Davisson et al. Water Resour. Res. 1999, 35, 3577–3579. [CrossRef]
- 139. Motzer, W.E.; Mohr, T.K.G.; McCraven, S.; Stanin, P. Stable and other isotope techniques for perchlorate source identification. *Environ. Forensics* **2006**, *7*, 89–100. [CrossRef]
- Palmer, P.C.; Gannett, M.W.; Hinkle, S.R. Isotopic characterization of three groundwater recharge sources and inferences for selected aquifers in the upper Klamath Basin of Oregon and California, USA. J. Hydrol. 2007, 336, 17–29. [CrossRef]
- 141. Murphy, E.; Schramke, J. Estimation of microbial respiration rates in groundwater by geochemical modeling constrained with stable isotopes. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* **1998**, *62*, 3395–3406. [CrossRef]
- 142. Chowdhury, A.H.; Uliana, M.; Wade, S. Ground water recharge and flow characterization using multiple isotopes. *Ground Water* 2008, *46*, 426–436. [CrossRef]
- 143. Doser, L.S.; Ferrell, R.E., Jr.; Longstaffe, F.J.; Walthall, P.M. Fluid flow through clayey soils: Stable isotope and mineralogical evidence. *Clay Miner.* **1998**, *33*, 43–49. [CrossRef]
- Nejatijahromi, Z.; Nassery, H.R.; Hosono, T.; Nakhaei, M.; Alijani, F.; Okumura, A. Groundwater nitrate contamination in an area using urban wastewaters for agricultural irrigation under arid climate condition, southeast of Tehran, Iran. *Agric. Water Manag.* 2019, 221, 397–414. [CrossRef]
- 145. Chen, J.; Taniguchi, M.; Liu, G.; Miyaoka, K.; Onodera, S.-I.; Tokunaga, T.; Fukushima, Y. Nitrate pollution of groundwater in the Yellow River delta, China. *Hydrogeol. J.* **2007**, *15*, 1605–1614. [CrossRef]

- 146. Chen, J.; Zhu, A.; Tang, C.; Luo, Y.; Zhang, Y. Nitrogen aspects of hydrological processes: A case study in Likeng landfill, Guangzhou, China. *Environ. Sci. Process. Impacts* **2014**, *16*, 2604–2616. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 147. Chen, J.; Tang, C.; Yu, J. Use of ¹⁸O, ²H and ¹⁵N to identify nitrate contamination of groundwater in a wastewater irrigated field near the city of Shijiazhuang, China. *J. Hydrol.* **2006**, *326*, 367–378. [CrossRef]
- Povinec, P.P.; Aggarwal, P.K.; Aureli, A.; Burnett, W.C.; Kontar, E.A.; Kulkarni, K.M.; Moore, W.S.; Rajar, R.; Taniguchi, M.; Comanducci, J.-F.; et al. Characterisation of submarine groundwater discharge offshore south-eastern Sicily. *J. Environ. Radioact.* 2006, *89*, 81–101. [CrossRef]
- 149. Aji, K.; Tang, C.; Song, X.; Kondoh, A.; Sakura, Y.; Yu, J.; Kaneko, S. Characteristics of chemistry and stable isotopes in groundwater of Chaobai and Yongding River basin, North China Plain. *Hydrol. Process.* **2008**, *22*, 63–72. [CrossRef]
- 150. Lu, Y.; Tang, C.; Chen, J.; Song, X.; Li, F.; Sakura, Y. Spatial characteristics of water quality, stable isotopes and tritium associated with groundwater flow in the Hutuo River alluvial fan plain of the North China Plain. *Hydrogeol. J.* **2008**, *16*, 1003–1015. [CrossRef]
- 151. Asano, Y.; Uchida, T.; Ohte, N. Residence times and flow paths of water in steep unchannelled catchments, Tanakami, Japan. J. Hydrol. 2002, 261, 173–192. [CrossRef]
- 152. Kabeya, N.; Katsuyama, M.; Kawasaki, M.; Ohte, N.; Sugimoto, A. Estimation of mean residence times of subsurface waters using seasonal variation in deuterium excess in a small headwater catchment in Japan. *Hydrol. Process.* **2007**, *21*, 308–322. [CrossRef]
- 153. Hedenquist, J.W.; Goff, F.; Phillips, F.M.; Elmore, D.; Stewart, M.K. Groundwater dilution and residence times, and constraints on chloride source, in the Mokai geothermal system, New Zealand, from chemical, stable isotope, tritium, and 36Cl data. *J. Geophys. Res.* 1990, 95, 19, 319–365, 375. [CrossRef]
- 154. Kong, Y.; Pang, Z.; Pang, J.; Wang, Y.; Yang, F. Stable Isotopes of Deep Groundwater in the Xiongxian Geothermal Field. *Procedia Earth Planet. Sci.* **2017**, *17*, 512–515. [CrossRef]
- 155. Szocs, T.; Kóbor Bujdosó, É. Combining multiple isotope and noble gas data with seismic profiles in an interpretation of hydro-geochemical anomalies. *E3S Web Conf.* **2019**, *98*, 07032. [CrossRef]
- 156. Awad, S. The study of the groundwater by using the ³⁴S and ¹⁸O of the sulphates-S¹⁸O₄ isotopes. *Phys. Procedia* **2014**, *55*, 41–45. [CrossRef]
- 157. Gao, J.; Li, Z.; Chen, Z.; Zhou, Y.; Liu, W.; Wang, L.; Zhou, J. Deterioration of groundwater quality along an increasing intensive land use pattern in a small catchment. *Agric. Water Manag.* **2021**, *253*, 106953. [CrossRef]
- 158. Böhnke, R.; Geyer, S.; Kowski, P. Using environmental isotopes ²H and ¹⁸O for identification of infiltration processes in floodplain ecosystems of the river Elbe. *Isot. Environ. Health Stud.* **2002**, *38*, 1–13. [CrossRef]
- Šilar, J.; Jilek, P.; Dobrova, H. Use of Isotope Analysis in Solving Environmental Problems in Power Engineering. Isot. Isot. Environ. Health Stud. 1993, 28, 321–330. [CrossRef]
- 160. Arumi, J.; Escudero, M.; Aguirre, E.; Salgado, J.C.; Aravena, R. Use of environmental isotopes to assess groundwater pollution caused by agricultural activities. *Isot. Environ. Health Stud.* 2020, *56*, 673–683. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 161. Tran, D.A.; Tsujimura, M.; Vo, L.P.; Nguyen, V.T.; Kambuku, D.; Dang, T.D. Hydrogeochemical characteristics of a multi-layered coastal aquifer system in the Mekong Delta, Vietnam. *Environ. Geochem. Health* **2020**, *42*, 661–680. [CrossRef]
- 162. Stoecker, F.; Babel, M.S.; Gupta, A.D.; Rivas, A.A.; Evers, M.; Kazama, F.; Nakamura, T. Hydrogeochemical and isotopic characterization of groundwater salinization in the Bangkok aquifer system, Thailand. *Environ. Earth Sci.* 2013, 68, 749–763. [CrossRef]
- 163. Tran, D.A.; Tsujimura, M.; Vo, L.P.; Nguyen, V.T.; Nguyen, L.D.; Dang, T.D. Stable isotope characteristics of water resources in the coastal area of the Vietnamese Mekong Delta. *Isot. Environ. Health Stud.* **2019**, *55*, 566–587. [CrossRef]
- 164. Schwehr, K.A.; Otosaka, S.; Merchel, S.; Kaplan, D.I.; Zhang, S.; Xu, C.; Li, H.-P.; Ho, Y.-F.; Yeager, C.M.; Santschi, P.H.; et al. Speciation of iodine isotopes inside and outside of a contaminant plume at the Savannah River Site. *Sci. Total Environ.* 2014, 497–498, 671–678. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- Yokochi, R.; Purtschert, R.; Suda, Y.; Sturchio, N.C.; Sültenfuß, J.; Vockenhuber, C. Chemical and isotopic constraints on hydrological processes in Unzen volcanic geothermal system. *J. Volcanol. Geotherm. Res.* 2021, 419, 107353. [CrossRef]
- 166. Matsumoto, S.; Machida, I.; Hebig, K.H.; Zeilfelder, S.; Ito, N. Estimation of very slow groundwater movement using a Single-Well Push-Pull test. J. Hydrol. 2020, 591, 125676. [CrossRef]
- 167. McGuire, K.J.; McDonnell, J.J. A review and evaluation of catchment transit time modeling. J. Hydrol. 2006, 330, 543–563. [CrossRef]
- 168. Zupic, I.; Čater, T. Bibliometric Methods in Management and Organization. Organ. Res. Methods 2015, 18, 429–472. [CrossRef]
- Hanisch, B.; Wald, A. A Bibliometric View on the Use of Contingency Theory in Project Management Research. *Proj. Manag. J.* 2012, 43, 4–23. [CrossRef]
- 170. Jeong, D.; Koo, Y. Analysis of Trend and Convergence for Science and Technology using the VOSviewer. *Int. J. Contents* **2016**, *12*, 54–58. [CrossRef]
- 171. Zhang, H.; Xu, Y.; Cheng, S.; Li, Q.; Yu, H. Application of the dual-isotope approach and Bayesian isotope mixing model to identify nitrate in groundwater of a multiple land-use area in Chengdu Plain, China. *Sci. Total Environ.* 2020, 717, 137134. [CrossRef]
- 172. Zhang, Q.; Wang, H.; Wang, L. Tracing nitrate pollution sources and transformations in the over-exploited groundwater region of north China using stable isotopes. *J. Contam. Hydrol.* **2018**, 218, 1–9. [CrossRef]

- 173. Hosono, T.; Tokunaga, T.; Kagabu, M.; Nakata, H.; Orishikida, T.; Lin, I.-T.; Shimada, J. The use of δ¹⁵N and δ¹⁸O tracers with an understanding of groundwater flow dynamics for evaluating the origins and attenuation mechanisms of nitrate pollution. *Water Res.* 2013, 47, 2661–2675. [CrossRef]
- 174. Larocque, M.; Pharand, M.C. Groundwater flow dynamics and vulnerability of an appalachian foothills aquifer (Quebec, Canada). [Dynamique de l'écoulement souterrain et vulnérabilité d'un aquifère du piémont appalachien (Québec, Canada)]. *Rev. Sci. L'eau* 2010, 23, 73–88. [CrossRef]
- 175. Abou Zakhem, B.; Hafez, R. Hydrochemical, isotopic and statistical characteristics of groundwater nitrate pollution in Damascus Oasis (Syria). *Environ. Earth Sci.* 2015, 74, 2781–2797. [CrossRef]
- 176. Egbi, C.D.; Anornu, G.; Appiah-Adjei, E.K.; Ganyaglo, S.Y.; Dampare, S.B. Evaluation of water quality using hydrochemistry, stable isotopes, and water quality indices in the Lower Volta River Basin of Ghana. *Environ. Dev. Sustain.* 2019, 21, 3033–3063. [CrossRef]
- 177. Bahir, M.; Ouazar, D.; Goumih, A.; Ouhamdouch, S. Evolution of the chemical and isotopic composition of groundwater under a semi-arid climate; the case of the Cenomano-Turonian aquifer within the Essaouira basin (Morocco). *Environ. Earth Sci.* 2019, 78, 353. [CrossRef]
- Antunes, C.; Díaz-Barradas, M.C.; Zunzunegui, M.; Vieira, S.; Máguas, C. Water source partitioning among plant functional types in a semi-arid dune ecosystem. J. Veg. Sci. 2018, 29, 671–683. [CrossRef]
- Achyuthan, H. The Thar Desert Calcretes: A Proxy for Understanding Late Quaternary Paleoclimate Shifts. In Proceedings of the Conference of the Arabian Journal of Geosciences, Sousse, Tunisia, 25–28 November 2019; Springer: Cham, Switzerland, 2019; pp. 53–57.
- Zhang, L.; Li, P.; He, X. Interactions between surface water and groundwater in selected tributaries of the Wei River (China) revealed by hydrochemistry and stable isotopes. *Hum. Ecol. Risk Assess. Int. J.* 2021, 28, 79–99. [CrossRef]
- 181. Amer, R.; Ripperdan, R.; Wang, T.; Encarnación, J. Groundwater quality and management in arid and semi-arid regions: Case study, Central Eastern Desert of Egypt. J. Afr. Earth Sci. 2012, 69, 13–25. [CrossRef]
- 182. Yousif, M. A new theory to enhance the groundwater-related decisions based on deciphering the palaeohydrologic regime under climate change in the Sahara. *Model. Earth Syst. Environ.* **2022**, *8*, 3885–3895. [CrossRef]
- 183. Rautio, A.B.; Korkka-Niemi, K.I.; Salonen, V.-P. Thermal infrared remote sensing in assessing groundwater and surface-water resources related to Hannukainen mining development site, northern Finland. [Télédétection infrarouge thermique pour évaluer les ressources en eau souterraine et de surface associée]. *Hydrogeol. J.* 2018, 26, 163–183. [CrossRef]
- 184. Abdalla, O.; Abri, R.A.; Semhi, K.; Hosni, T.A.; Amerjeed, M.; Clark, I. Groundwater recharge to ophiolite aquifer in North Oman: Constrained by stable isotopes and geochemistry. *Environ. Earth Sci.* **2016**, *75*, 1117. [CrossRef]
- 185. Anglés, M.; Folch, A.; Oms, O.; Maestro, E.; Mas-Pla, J. Stratigraphic and structural controls on groundwater flow in an outcropping fossil fan delta: The case of Sant Llorenç del Munt range (NE Spain). [Contrôles stratigraphiques et structuraux sur les écoulements d'eau souterraine dans un éventail deltaïque fo]. *Hydrogeol. J.* 2017, 25, 2467–2487. [CrossRef]
- 186. Ayuba, R.; Tijani, M.N.; Snow, D. Hydrochemistry and stable isotopes (¹⁸O and ²H) characteristics of groundwater in Lokoja and its environs, central Nigeria. *Environ. Earth Sci.* 2019, 78, 582. [CrossRef]
- 187. Morante, F.; Montalván, F.J.; Carrión, P.; Herrera, G.; Heredia, J.; Elorza, F.J.; Pilco, D.; Solórzano, J. Hydrochemical and Geological Correlation to Establish the Groundwater Salinity of the Coastal Aquifer of the Manglaralto River Basin, Ecuador. In WIT Transactions on Ecology and the Environment; WIT Press: Billerica, MA, USA, 2019; Volume 229, pp. 139–149.
- Ahmed, A.; Clark, I. Groundwater flow and geochemical evolution in the Central Flinders Ranges, South Australia. *Sci. Total Environ.* 2016, 572, 837–851. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 189. Eissa, M.A.; Thomas, J.M.; Pohll, G.; Shouakar-Stash, O.; Hershey, R.L.; Dawoud, M. Groundwater recharge and salinization in the arid coastal plain aquifer of the Wadi Watir delta, Sinai, Egypt. *Appl. Geochem.* **2016**, *71*, 48–62. [CrossRef]
- 190. Schenk, E.R.; O'Donnell, F.; Springer, A.E.; Stevens, L.E. The impacts of tree stand thinning on groundwater recharge in aridland forests. *Ecol. Eng.* **2020**, *145*, 105701. [CrossRef]
- Ahmed, M.A.; Samie, S.G.A.; El-Maghrabi, H.M. Recharge and contamination sources of shallow and deep groundwater of pleistocene aquifer in El-Sadat industrial city: Isotope and hydrochemical approaches. *Environ. Earth Sci.* 2011, 62, 751–768. [CrossRef]
- 192. Demlie, M.; Wohnlich, S.; Gizaw, B.; Stichler, W. Groundwater recharge in the Akaki catchment, central Ethiopia: Evidence from environmental isotopes (δ¹⁸O, δ²H and ³H) and chloride mass balance. *Hydrol. Process.* 2007, 21, 807–818. [CrossRef]
- 193. Kattan, Z. Chemical and environmental isotope study of precipitation in Syria. J. Arid Environ. 1997, 35, 601–615. [CrossRef]
- 194. Abiye, T.A.; Leketa, K.C. The need for managing historic groundwater in the Limpopo River Basin, southern Africa: Based on the δ¹⁸O, δ²H and ¹⁴C data. *Groundw. Sustain. Dev.* 2021, *14*, 100583. [CrossRef]
- 195. Chen, Z.; Wei, W.; Liu, J.; Wang, Y.; Chen, J. Identifying the recharge sources and age of groundwater in the Songnen Plain (Northeast China) using environmental isotopes. *Hydrogeol. J.* **2011**, *19*, 163–176. [CrossRef]
- Duque, C.; López-Chicano, M.; Calvache, M.L.; Martín-Rosales, W.; Gómez-Fontalva, J.M.; Crespo, F. Recharge sources and hydrogeological effects of irrigation and an influent river identified by stable isotopes in the Motril-Salobreña aquifer (Southern Spain). *Hydrol. Process.* 2011, 25, 2261–2274. [CrossRef]
- 197. Guan, Z.; Jia, Z.; Zhao, Z.; You, Q. Identification of inrush water recharge sources using hydrochemistry and stable isotopes: A case study of Mindong No. 1 coal mine in north-east Inner Mongolia, China. J. Earth Syst. Sci. 2019, 128, 200. [CrossRef]

- 198. Abbott, M.D.; Lini, A.; Bierman, P.R. δ¹⁸O, δD and ³H measurements constrain groundwater recharge patterns in an upland fractured bedrock aquifer, Vermont, USA. *J. Hydrol.* **2000**, *228*, 101–112. [CrossRef]
- 199. Agoubi, B. Assessing hydrothermal groundwater flow path using Kohonen's SOM, geochemical data, and groundwater temperature cooling trend. *Environ. Sci. Pollut. Res.* 2018, 25, 13597–13610. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- Alkinani, M.; Merkel, B. Hydrochemical and isotopic investigation of groundwater of Al-Batin alluvial fan aquifer, Southern Iraq. Environ. Earth Sci. 2017, 76, 301. [CrossRef]
- 201. Ako, A.A.; Shimada, J.; Hosono, T.; Kagabu, M.; Richard, A.; Nkeng, G.E.; Tongwa, A.F.; Ono, M.; Eyong, G.E.T.; Tandia, B.K.; et al. Flow dynamics and age of groundwater within a humid equatorial active volcano (Mount Cameroon) deduced by δD, δ¹⁸O, ³H and chlorofluorocarbons (CFCs). *J. Hydrol.* 2013, 502, 156–176. [CrossRef]
- 202. Li, B.; Song, X.; Yang, L.; Yao, D.; Xu, Y. Insights onto Hydrologic and Hydro-Chemical Processes of Riparian Groundwater Using Environmental Tracers in the Highly Disturbed Shaying River Basin, China. *Water* **2020**, *12*, 1939. [CrossRef]
- 203. Robinet, J.; Minella, J.P.G.; de Barros, C.A.P.; Schlesner, A.; Lücke, A.; Ameijeiras-Mariño, Y.; Opfergelt, S.; Vanderborght, J.; Govers, G. Impacts of forest conversion and agriculture practices on water pathways in Southern Brazil. *Hydrol. Process.* 2018, 32, 2304–2317. [CrossRef]
- 204. Abiye, T.A.; Tshipala, D.; Leketa, K.; Villholth, K.G.; Ebrahim, G.Y.; Magombeyi, M.; Butler, M. Hydrogeological characterization of crystalline aquifer in the Hout River Catchment, Limpopo province, South Africa. *Groundw. Sustain. Dev.* 2020, 11, 100406. [CrossRef]
- 205. Akiyama, T.; Kubota, J.; Fujita, K.; Tsujimura, M.; Nakawo, M.; Avtar, R.; Kharrazi, A. Use of Water Balance and Tracer-Based Approaches to Monitor Groundwater Recharge in the Hyper-Arid Gobi Desert of Northwestern China. *Environments* 2018, 5, 55. [CrossRef]
- Abiye, T.A.; Leshomo, J.T. Groundwater flow and radioactivity in Namaqualand, South Africa. *Environ. Earth Sci.* 2013, 70, 281–293. [CrossRef]
- De Deckker, P. Groundwater interactions control dolomite and magnesite precipitation in saline playas in the Western District Volcanic Plains of Victoria, Australia. *Sediment. Geol.* 2019, 380, 105–126. [CrossRef]
- Haji, M.; Qin, D.; Guo, Y.; Li, L.; Wang, D.; Karuppannan, S.; Shube, H. Origin and geochemical evolution of groundwater in the Abaya Chamo basin of the Main Ethiopian Rift: Application of multi-tracer approaches. [Origine et évolution géochimique des eaux souterraines dans le b]. *Hydrogeol. J.* 2021, 29, 1219–1238. [CrossRef]
- Abe, Y.; Aravena, R.; Zopfi, J.; Parker, B.; Hunkeler, D. Evaluating the fate of chlorinated ethenes in streambed sediments by combining stable isotope, geochemical and microbial methods. *J. Contam. Hydrol.* 2009, 107, 10–21. [CrossRef]
- 210. Lamontagne, S.; Hicks, W.S.; Souter, N.J.; Walter, M.J.; Wen, L. Water and salt balance of a saline water disposal basin during an experimental flooding and drying cycle (Loveday Disposal Basin, Australia). *Hydrol. Process.* **2009**, *23*, 3453–3463. [CrossRef]
- 211. Autio, A.; Ala-Aho, P.; Ronkanen, A.; Rossi, P.M.; Kløve, B. Implications of Peat Soil Conceptualization for Groundwater Exfiltration in Numerical Modeling: A Study on a Hypothetical Peatland Hillslope. *Water Resour. Res.* 2020, 56, e2019WR026203. [CrossRef]
- Ganyaglo, S.Y.; Osae, S.; Akiti, T.; Armah, T.; Gourcy, L.; Vitvar, T.; Ito, M.; Otoo, I. Groundwater residence time in basement aquifers of the Ochi-Narkwa Basin in the Central Region of Ghana. J. Afr. Earth Sci. 2017, 134, 590–599. [CrossRef]
- Carreira, P.M.; Marques, J.M.; Nunes, D.; Santos, F.A.M.; Gonçalves, R.; Pina, A.; Gomes, A.M. Isotopic and Geochemical Tracers in the Evaluation of Groundwater Residence Time and Salinization Problems at Santiago Island, Cape Verde. *Procedia Earth Planet*. *Sci.* 2013, 7, 113–117. [CrossRef]
- 214. Al Faitouri, M.; Sanford, W.E. Stable and radio-isotope analysis to determine recharge timing and paleoclimate of sandstone aquifers in central and southeast Libya. *Hydrogeol. J.* 2015, 23, 707–717. [CrossRef]
- Abu-Jaber, N. Geochemical evolution and recharge of the shallow aquifers at Tulul al Ashaqif, NE Jordan. *Environ. Geol.* 2001, 41, 372–383. [CrossRef]
- 216. Candel, J.; Brooks, E.; Sánchez-Murillo, R.; Grader, G.; Dijksma, R. Identifying groundwater recharge connections in the Moscow (USA) sub-basin using isotopic tracers and a soil moisture routing model. [Identification des cheminements d'eau de la recharge d'aquifère dans le sous bassin de Moscou (Etats-Unis d'Amérique) en u]. *Hydrogeol. J.* 2016, 24, 1739–1751. [CrossRef]
- 217. Akurugu, B.A.; Chegbeleh, L.P.; Yidana, S.M. Characterisation of groundwater flow and recharge in crystalline basement rocks in the Talensi District, Northern Ghana. *J. Afr. Earth Sci.* 2020, *161*, 103665. [CrossRef]
- Batista, L.V.; Gastmans, D.; Sánchez-Murillo, R.; Farinha, B.S.; dos Santos, S.M.R.; Kiang, C.H. Groundwater and surface water connectivity within the recharge area of Guarani aquifer system during El Niño 2014–2016. *Hydrol. Process.* 2018, 32, 2483–2495. [CrossRef]
- Bekele, E.; Zhang, Y.; Donn, M.; McFarlane, D. Inferring groundwater dynamics in a coastal aquifer near wastewater infiltration ponds and shallow wetlands (Kwinana, Western Australia) using combined hydrochemical, isotopic and statistical approaches. *J. Hydrol.* 2019, 568, 1055–1070. [CrossRef]
- 220. Kaown, D.; Koh, D.-C.; Solomon, D.K.; Yoon, Y.-Y.; Yang, J.; Lee, K.-K. Delineation of recharge patterns and contaminant transport using 3H-3He in a shallow aquifer contaminated by chlorinated solvents in South Korea. [Délimitation des modalités de recharge et de transport de contaminants à partir de 3H-3He dans un aquifère de]. *Hydrogeol. J.* 2014, 22, 1041–1054. [CrossRef]

- 221. Arnoux, M.; Gibert-Brunet, E.; Barbecot, F.; Guillon, S.; Gibson, J.; Noret, A. Interactions between groundwater and seasonally ice-covered lakes: Using water stable isotopes and radon-222 multilayer mass balance models. *Hydrol. Process.* 2017, *31*, 2566–2581. [CrossRef]
- Kalvāns, A.; Babre, A.; Dēliņa, A.; Popovs, K. Water stable isotope data set in temperate, lowland catchment, two years of monthly observations, River Salaca, Latvia. Data Br. 2020, 30, 105607. [CrossRef]
- Kalvāns, A.; Dēliņa, A.; Babre, A.; Popovs, K. An insight into water stable isotope signatures in temperate catchment. J. Hydrol. 2020, 582, 124442. [CrossRef]
- 224. Chandrajith, R.; Diyabalanage, S.; Premathilake, K.M.; Hanke, C.; van Geldern, R.; Barth, J.A.C. Controls of evaporative irrigation return flows in comparison to seawater intrusion in coastal karstic aquifers in northern Sri Lanka: Evidence from solutes and stable isotopes. *Sci. Total Environ.* 2016, 548–549, 421–428. [CrossRef]
- 225. Qiu, H.; Gui, H.; Cui, L.; Pan, Z. Hydrogeochemical Processes and Quality Assessment of Groundwater in Sulin Mining Area, Northern Anhui Province, China. *Water Resour.* **2021**, *48*, 991–1000. [CrossRef]
- Manciati, C.; Taupin, J.D.; Patris, N.; Leduc, C.; Casiot, C. Diverging Water Ages Inferred From Hydrodynamics, Hydrochemical and Isotopic Tracers in a Tropical Andean Volcano-Sedimentary Confined Aquifer System. Front. Water 2021, 3, 597641. [CrossRef]
- 227. Thaw, M.; Visser, A.; Bibby, R.; Deinhart, A.; Oerter, E.; Conklin, M. Vegetation water sources in California's Sierra Nevada (USA) are young and change over time, a multi-isotope (δ¹⁸O, δ²H, ³H) tracer approach. *Hydrol. Process.* **2021**, *35*, e14249. [CrossRef]
- 228. Tweed, S.; Leblanc, M.; Cartwright, I.; Favreau, G.; Leduc, C. Arid zone groundwater recharge and salinisation processes; an example from the Lake Eyre Basin, Australia. *J. Hydrol.* **2011**, *408*, 257–275. [CrossRef]
- Kamel, S.; Dassi, L.; Zouari, K. Hydrogeological and hydrochemical approach of hydrodynamic exchanges between deep and shallow aquifers in the Djerid basin (Tunisia). [Approche hydrogéologique et hydrochimique des échanges hydrodynamiques entre aquifères profond et superficiel du bassin d]. *Hydrol. Sci. J.* 2006, *51*, 713–730. [CrossRef]
- Jolly, I.D.; Walker, G.R. Is the field water use of Eucalyptus largiflorens F. Muell. affected by short-term flooding? *Austral Ecol.* 1996, 21, 173–183. [CrossRef]
- 231. Huang, T.M.; Pang, Z.H.; Chen, Y.N.; Kong, Y.L. Groundwater circulation relative to water quality and vegetation in an arid transitional zone linking oasis, desert and river. *Chin. Sci. Bull.* **2013**, *58*, 3088–3097. [CrossRef]
- 232. Herczeg, A.L.; Leaney, F.W. Review: Environmental tracers in arid-zone hydrology. Hydrogeol. J. 2011, 19, 17–29. [CrossRef]
- Herrera, C.; Gamboa, C.; Custodio, E.; Jordan, T.; Godfrey, L.; Jódar, J.; Luque, J.A.; Vargas, J.; Sáez, A. Groundwater origin and recharge in the hyperarid Cordillera de la Costa, Atacama Desert, northern Chile. *Sci. Total Environ.* 2018, 624, 114–132. [CrossRef]
- 234. Abotalib, A.Z.; Sultan, M.; Elkadiri, R. Groundwater processes in Saharan Africa: Implications for landscape evolution in arid environments. *Earth-Sci. Rev.* 2016, 156, 108–136. [CrossRef]
- Bahir, M.; Ouazar, D.; Ouhamdouch, S. Dam effect on groundwater characteristics from area under semi-arid climate: Case of the Zerrar dam within Essaouira basin (Morocco). *Carbonates Evaporites* 2019, 34, 709–720. [CrossRef]
- Bahir, M.; Ouhamdouch, S.; Carreira, P.M. Geochemical and isotopic approach to decrypt the groundwater salinization origin of coastal aquifers from semi-arid areas (Essaouira basin, Western Morocco). *Environ. Earth Sci.* 2018, 77, 485. [CrossRef]
- Behera, A.K.; Chakrapani, G.J.; Kumar, S.; Rai, N. Identification of seawater intrusion signatures through geochemical evolution of groundwater: A case study based on coastal region of the Mahanadi delta, Bay of Bengal, India. *Nat. Hazards* 2019, 97, 1209–1230. [CrossRef]
- Ouhamdouch, S.; Bahir, M.; Ouazar, D.; Carreira, P.M.; Zouari, K. Evaluation of climate change impact on groundwater from semi-arid environment (Essaouira Basin, Morocco) using integrated approaches. *Environ. Earth Sci.* 2019, 78, 449. [CrossRef]
- Eissa, M.A.; Thomas, J.M.; Pohll, G.; Hershey, R.L.; Dahab, K.A.; Dawoud, M.I.; ElShiekh, A.; Gomaa, M.A. Groundwater resource sustainability in the Wadi Watir delta, Gulf of Aqaba, Sinai, Egypt. *Hydrogeol. J.* 2013, *21*, 1833–1851. [CrossRef]
- Nair, I.S.; Brindha, K.; Elango, L. Assessing the origin and processes controlling groundwater salinization in coastal aquifers through integrated hydrochemical, isotopic and hydrogeochemical modelling techniques. *Hydrol. Sci. J.* 2021, 66, 152–164. [CrossRef]
- 241. Reddy, D.V.; Nagabhushanam, P.; Madhav, T.; Anita, M.; Sudheer Kumar, M. Hydrogeologically controlled freshwater dynamics in the coastal sand dune aquifer of Ongole coast (AP), India. [Contrôle hydrogéologique de la dynamique de l'eau douce dans l'aquifère de dunes de sable de la côte d'Ongole (Andhra Pradesh, Inde)]. Hydrol. Sci. J. 2014, 59, 2186–2202. [CrossRef]
- 242. Kanagaraj, G.; Elango, L.; Sridhar, S.G.D.; Gowrisankar, G. Hydrogeochemical processes and influence of seawater intrusion in coastal aquifers south of Chennai, Tamil Nadu, India. *Environ. Sci. Pollut. Res.* **2018**, 25, 8989–9011. [CrossRef]
- Hepburn, E.; Cendón, D.I.; Bekele, D.; Currell, M. Environmental isotopes as indicators of groundwater recharge, residence times and salinity in a coastal urban redevelopment precinct in Australia. [Utilisation des isotopes environnementaux comme indicateurs de la rech]. *Hydrogeol. J.* 2020, *28*, 503–520. [CrossRef]
- 244. Cantafio, L.J.; Ryan, M.C. Quantifying baseflow and water-quality impacts from a gravel-dominated alluvial aquifer in an urban reach of a large Canadian river. [Quantification du débit de base et des impacts sur la qualité de l'eau imputables à l'aquifère alluvial à prédominance gra]. *Hydrogeol. J.* **2014**, *22*, 957–970. [CrossRef]
- Rueedi, J.; Cronin, A.A.; Taylor, R.G.; Morris, B.L. Tracing sources of carbon in urban groundwater using δ 13CTDIC ratios. *Environ. Geol.* 2007, 52, 541–557. [CrossRef]

- 246. Gilabert-Alarcón, C.; Daesslé, L.W.; Salgado-Méndez, S.O.; Pérez-Flores, M.A.; Knöller, K.; Kretzschmar, T.G.; Stumpp, C. Effects of reclaimed water discharge in the Maneadero coastal aquifer, Baja California, Mexico. *Appl. Geochem.* 2018, 92, 121–139. [CrossRef]
- 247. Re, V.; Cissé Faye, S.; Faye, A.; Faye, S.; Gaye, C.B.; Sacchi, E.; Zuppi, G.M. Water quality decline in coastal aquifers under anthropic pressure: The case of a suburban area of Dakar (Senegal). *Environ. Monit. Assess.* 2011, 172, 605–622. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 248. Abdelmohsen, K.; Sultan, M.; Ahmed, M.; Save, H.; Elkaliouby, B.; Emil, M.; Yan, E.; Abotalib, A.Z.; Krishnamurthy, R.V.; Abdelmalik, K. Response of deep aquifers to climate variability. *Sci. Total Environ.* **2019**, *677*, 530–544. [CrossRef]
- Bedaso, Z.K.; Wu, S.-Y.; Johnson, A.N.; McTighe, C. Assessing groundwater sustainability under changing climate using isotopic tracers and climate modelling, southwest Ohio, USA. *Hydrol. Sci. J.* 2019, 64, 798–807. [CrossRef]
- Živković, K.; Radulović, M.; Lojen, S.; Pucarević, M. Overview of the chemical and isotopic investigations of the mareza springs and the Zeta River in Montenegro. Water 2020, 12, 957. [CrossRef]
- 251. Wanke, H.; Gaj, M.; Beyer, M.; Koeniger, P.; Hamutoko, J.T. Stable isotope signatures of meteoric water in the Cuvelai-Etosha Basin, Namibia: Seasonal characteristics, trends and relations to southern African patterns. *Isot. Environ. Health Stud.* 2018, 54, 588–607. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 252. Qian, H.; Li, P.; Wu, J.; Zhou, Y. Isotopic characteristics of precipitation, surface and ground waters in the Yinchuan plain, Northwest China. *Environ. Earth Sci.* 2013, 70, 57–70. [CrossRef]
- Li, F.; Song, X.; Tang, C.; Liu, C.; Yu, J.; Zhang, W. Tracing infiltration and recharge using stable isotope in Taihang Mt., North China. *Environ. Geol.* 2007, 53, 687–696. [CrossRef]
- Hildenbrand, A.; Marlin, C.; Conroy, A.; Gillot, P.-Y.; Filly, A.; Massault, M. Isotopic approach of rainfall and groundwater circulation in the volcanic structure of Tahiti-Nui (French Polynesia). J. Hydrol. 2005, 302, 187–208. [CrossRef]
- Yager, R.M.; Kappel, W.M. Infiltration and hydraulic connections from the Niagara River to a fractured-dolomite aquifer in Niagara Falls, New York. J. Hydrol. 1998, 206, 84–97. [CrossRef]
- Iacurto, S.; Grelle, G.; de Filippi, F.M.; Sappa, G. Karst Recharge Areas Identified by Combined Application of Isotopes and Hydrogeological Budget. *Water* 2021, 13, 1965. [CrossRef]
- 257. Sappa, G.; Vitale, S.; Ferranti, F. Identifying karst aquifer recharge areas using environmental isotopes: A case study in central Italy. *Geosciences* **2018**, *8*, 351. [CrossRef]
- 258. Franciskovic-Bilinski, S.; Cuculić, V.; Bilinski, H.; Häusler, H.; Stadler, P. Geochemical and stable isotopic variability within two rivers rising under the same mountain, but belonging to two distant watersheds. *Chem. Der Erde* 2013, 73, 293–308. [CrossRef]
- 259. Eftimi, R.; Akiti, T.; Amataj, S.; Benishke, R.; Zojer, H.; Zoto, J. Environmental hydrochemical and stabile isotope methods used to characterise the relation between karst water and surface water. *Acque Sotter. Ital. J. Groundw.* **2017**, *6*, 7–20. [CrossRef]
- Leketa, K.; Abiye, T. Using environmental tracers to characterize groundwater flow mechanisms in the fractured crystalline and karst aquifers in upper crocodile river basin, Johannesburg, South Africa. *Hydrology* 2021, *8*, 50. [CrossRef]
- Golla, J.K.; Kuessner, M.L.; Henehan, M.J.; Bouchez, J.; Rempe, D.M.; Druhan, J.L. The evolution of lithium isotope signatures in fluids draining actively weathering hillslopes. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 2021, 567, 116988. [CrossRef]
- Pranckute, R. Web of Science (WoS) and Scopus: The Titans of Bibliographic Information in Today's Academic World. *Publications* 2021, 9, 12. [CrossRef]
- Wilkinson, D.J. Historical and contemporary stable isotope tracer approaches to studying mammalian protein metabolism. *Mass Spectrom. Rev.* 2018, 37, 57–80. [CrossRef]
- 264. Sioli, H. Hydrochemistry and Geology in the Brazilian Amazon Region. *Amaz. Limnol. Oecologia Reg. Syst. Fluminis Amaz.* 1968, 1, 267–277.
- 265. Jones, B.F.; Eugster, H.P.; Rettig, S.L. Hydrochemistry of the Lake Magadi basin, Kenya. Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta 1977, 41, 53–72. [CrossRef]
- 266. De Groot, P.A. (Ed.) Handbook of Stable Isotope Analytical Techniques; Elsevier: Amsterdam, The Netherlands, 2005; ISBN 0444511148.
- 267. Katzenberg, M.A.; Waters-Rist, A.L. Stable Isotope Analysis. In *Biological Anthropology of the Human Skeleton*; John Wiley & Sons, Inc.: Hoboken, NJ, USA, 2018; pp. 467–504.
- 268. Hobson, K.A. Tracing origins and migration of wildlife using stable isotopes: A review. Oecologia 1999, 120, 314–326. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- Phillips, D.L.; Newsome, S.D.; Gregg, J.W. Combining sources in stable isotope mixing models: Alternative methods. *Oecologia* 2005, 144, 520–527. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- Sveinbjörnsdóttir, Á.E.; Johnsen, S.J.; Sveinbjornsdottir, A.E.; Johnsen, S.J. Stable Isotope Study of the Thingvallavatn Area. Groundwater Origin, Age and Evaporation Models. *Oikos* 1992, *64*, 136. [CrossRef]
- McClelland, J.W.; Valiela, I.; Michener, R.H. Nitrogen-stable isotope signatures in estuarine food webs: A record of increasing urbanization in coastal watersheds. *Limnol. Oceanogr.* 1997, 42, 930–937. [CrossRef]
- McClelland, J.W.; Valiela, I. Linking nitrogen in estuarine producers to land-derived sources. *Limnol. Oceanogr.* 1998, 43, 577–585.
 [CrossRef]
- 273. Narendra, B.H.; Siregar, C.A.; Dharmawan, I.W.S.; Sukmana, A.; Pratiwi; Pramono, I.B.; Basuki, T.M.; Nugroho, H.Y.S.H.; Supangat, A.B.; Purwanto; et al. A Review on Sustainability of Watershed Management in Indonesia. *Sustainability* **2021**, *13*, 11125. [CrossRef]

- 274. Kalbus, E.; Reinstorf, F.; Schirmer, M. Measuring methods for groundwater–surface water interactions: A review. *Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci.* 2006, *10*, 873–887. [CrossRef]
- Komada, T.; Burdige, D.J.; Li, H.-L.; Magen, C.; Chanton, J.P.; Cada, A.K. Organic matter cycling across the sulfate-methane transition zone of the Santa Barbara Basin, California Borderland. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* 2016, 176, 259–278. [CrossRef]
- 276. Fu, C.; Li, X.; Ma, J.; Liu, L.; Gao, M.; Bai, Z. A hydrochemistry and multi-isotopic study of groundwater origin and hydrochemical evolution in the middle reaches of the Kuye River basin. *Appl. Geochem.* **2018**, *98*, 82–93. [CrossRef]
- 277. Mapoma, H.W.T.; Xie, X.; Zhu, Y.; Liu, Y.; Sitolo-Banda, G.C. Trace element geochemical evolution and groundwater origin in North Rukuru–Songwe alluvial aquifer of northern Malawi. *Environ. Earth Sci.* 2016, *75*, 877. [CrossRef]
- 278. Harter, T.; Castaldo, G.; Visser, A.; Fogg, G.E. Effect of groundwater age and recharge source on nitrate concentrations in domestic wells in the san joaquin valley. *Environ. Sci. Technol.* **2021**, *55*, 2265–2275. [CrossRef]
- Kambuku, D.; Tsujimura, M.; Kagawa, S.; Mdala, H. Corroborating stable isotopic data with pumping test data to investigate recharge and groundwater flow processes in a fractured rock aquifer, Rivirivi Catchment, Malawi. *Environ. Earth Sci.* 2018, 77, 226. [CrossRef]
- Guo, Q.; Yang, Y.; Han, Y.; Li, J.; Wang, X. Assessment of surface–groundwater interactions using hydrochemical and isotopic techniques in a coalmine watershed, NW China. *Environ. Earth Sci.* 2019, 78, 91. [CrossRef]
- 281. Schwerdtfeger, J.; Hartmann, A.; Weiler, M. A tracer-based simulation approach to quantify seasonal dynamics of surfacegroundwater interactions in the Pantanal wetland. *Hydrol. Process.* **2016**, *30*, 2590–2602. [CrossRef]
- 282. Hassan, H.; El Rayan, R.; Huissen, R. Surface -Groundwater Interaction in the Area between El-Timsah Lake and Ismailia Canal Using Hydrochemical and Isotopic Techniques. Arab J. Nucl. Sci. Appl. 2020, 53, 276–290. [CrossRef]
- Gates, J.B.; Edmunds, W.M.; Darling, W.G.; Ma, J.; Pang, Z.; Young, A.A. Conceptual model of recharge to southeastern Badain Jaran Desert groundwater and lakes from environmental tracers. *Appl. Geochem.* 2008, 23, 3519–3534. [CrossRef]
- Newman, B.D.; Osenbrück, K.; Aeschbach-Hertig, W.; Solomon, D.K.; Cook, P.; Rózánski, K.; Kipfer, R. Dating of "young" groundwaters using environmental tracers: Advantages, applications, and research needs. *Isot. Environ. Health Stud.* 2010, 46, 259–278. [CrossRef]
- Parlov, J.; Kovač, Z.; Barešić, J. The study of the interactions between Sava River and Zagreb aquifer system (Croatia) using water stable isotopes. E3S Web Conf. 2019, 98, 12017. [CrossRef]
- Dhakate, R.; Modi, D.; Rao, V.V.S.G. Impact assessment of coal mining on river water and groundwater and its interaction through hydrological, isotopic characteristics, and simulation flow modeling. *Arab. J. Geosci.* 2019, 12, 8. [CrossRef]
- Herrera Franco, G.; Carrión Mero, P.; Briones Bitar, J. Management practices for a sustainable community and its impact on development, Manglaralto-Santa elena, Ecuador. In Proceedings of the 17th LACCEI International Multi-Conference for Engineering, Education and Technology, Montego Bay, Jamaica, 24–26 June 2019; Volume 2019, pp. 24–26. [CrossRef]
- Herrera-Franco, G.; Carrión Mero, P.; Alvarado, N. Participatory Process for Local Development: Sustainability of Water Resources in Rural Communities: Case Manglaralto-Santa Elena, Ecuador. In *Handbook of Sustainability Science and Research*; Springer International Publishing: Berlin/Heidelberg, Germany, 2018; pp. 663–676. ISBN 9783319630069.
- Apipalakul, C.; Wirojangud, W.; Ngang, T.K. Development of Community Participation on Water Resource Conflict Management. Procedia—Soc. Behav. Sci. 2015, 186, 325–330. [CrossRef]
- 290. Ghose, B.; Dhawan, H.; Kulkarni, H.; Aslekar, U.; Patil, S.; Ramachandrudu, M.V.; Cheela, B.; Jadeja, Y.; Thankar, B.; Chopra, R.; et al. Peoples' Participation for Sustainable Groundwater Management. In *Clean and Sustainable Groundwater in India*; Saha, D., Marwaha, S., Mukherjee, A., Eds.; Springer: Berlin/Heidelberg, Germany, 2018; pp. 215–234.
- 291. Herrera-Franco, G.; Bravo-Montero, L.; Carrión-Mero, P.; Morante-Carballo, F.; Apolo-Masache, B. Community management of the Olón coastal aquifer, Ecuador, and its impact on the supply of water suitable for human consumption. In Proceedings of the Sustainable Development and Planning XI, Online, 9–11 September 2020; WIT Press: Billerica, MA, USA, 2020; pp. 169–181.